



Asian Development Bank

Hc Ban Quản lý các PA Nông nghiệp

Đan Ban xử lý

Southeast Asia Department

Các văn đề ADB nên

19 January 2011

H. E. Bui Ba Bong  
Vice Minister  
Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)  
Hanoi, Viet Nam  
Fax No: (84 4) 845 4319

Bong

Excellency:

**Subject: Loan 2283-VIE: Agriculture Science and Technology  
– Loan Review Mission (17-23 December 2010)**

We would like to express our sincere gratitude for the kind cooperation extended by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) to the ADB Mission. The Mission was able to carry out a comprehensive review and received support from the relevant departments of MARD and other concerned agencies. Enclosed is the revised Aide Memoire of the Mission. We will appreciate receiving MARD's confirmation of the Aide Memoire before 20 February 2011.

We recognize MARD's efforts on the overall progress of the Project. As a follow up on the Mission's findings, we would like to request your oversight and guidance on the following aspects to ensure that the Project could excel into a flagship project for the government:

- (i) Submit detailed workplan and budget for the loan extension period, including schedule of engagement consultants and their TORs by 20 February 2011;
- (ii) Clarify roles of NAEC in overseeing the implementation of extension activities and in extracting experiences from the AST project in implementing market-mechanism in extension system nation-wide by 20 February 2011;
- (iii) Strengthen implementation of monitoring system and impact assessment based on the DMF for all project components;
- (iv) Improve quality of curriculum to reflect the national climate change and food safety action plan and improve participation of private sector in curriculum development;
- (v) Expedite submission for ADB approval of pending draft bidding documents, and award of contract, for the procurement of civil works and goods;
- (vi) Obtain resolution on the timely availability of counterpart funding from the People's Committee, especially in Ninh Thuan province by 20 February 2011;
- (vii) Resolve outstanding issues in Dak Nong Province to expedite project implementation; and
- (viii) We support MARD's proposal to highlight its successful implementation experience on market-based research and extension systems at the ADB Annual Meeting in Hanoi in May 2011.

Your continued cooperation and support would be highly appreciated.

Sincerely,

Javed H. Mir  
Director  
Environment, Natural Resources and Agriculture Division

Aide Memoire  
17-23 December 2010

Loan 2283-VIE(SF): Agriculture Science and  
Technology Project  
- 6th Loan Review Mission

Asian Development Bank

**ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK**  
**Loan No. 2283-VIE (SF): Agriculture Science and Technology Project**  
**Aide Memoire of the Loan Review Mission**  
**(17-23 December 2010)**

**i. INTRODUCTION**

1. On 17-23 December 2010, the Asian Development Bank (ADB) fielded a Loan Review Mission<sup>1</sup> to Viet Nam to review the implementation of Loan No. 2283-VIE (SF): Agriculture Science and Technology Project (The Project). To assess whether the Project's planned outputs can be delivered and the intended outcome can be achieved, the Mission conducted comprehensive discussions with the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)—the Executing Agency (EA) of the Project—its International Cooperation Department and Central Project Management Unit (CPMU), Department of Finance, Department of Organization and Personnel (DOP), Department of Science, Technology and Environment (DSTE), Ministry of Finance, National Agricultural and Extension Center (NAEC), Institute Project Management Units (IPMUs) including Northern Mountainous Forestry Science Institute (NOMAFSI), and Provincial Project Management Unit (PPMU) in Province. The Mission visited six research projects in Phu Tho and Thai Nguyen Provinces in Northern Viet Nam and visited one research project in Hanoi. The research projects were on intercropping of Mundo Grass, Cardimum production, compost from cassava waste, botanical dye for food, indigenous tree, and soil detoxification. The Mission attended the Review Workshop on Research Projects financed by the Project in Ning Binh Province. The Workshop was organized by DSTE and CPMU and attended by 85 participants to review research progress of 58 research projects in Batch I. The Mission also visited private sector firm with activities related to development of niche market products produced by the poor to explore the possibilities of involving them to assist product development possible in Dak Nong Province.

2. The Mission (i) reviewed the implementation of the four components and updated the project implementation schedule accordingly; (ii) followed up on the implementation of the research programs towards a pro-poor, market-oriented approach and their linkage to extension activities; (iii) reviewed the progress of extension demonstrations, extension materials developed, methodology applied, and effectiveness of the service providers; (iv) discussed progress on the organization of baseline information and performance indicators developed for the research and extension activities; (v) discussed the availability and timely allocation of counterpart funding; (vi) visited Phu Tho and neighboring provinces to discuss progress of research programs; (vii) visited NOMAFSI to check on delivery/usage of research and laboratory equipment procured, among other things; (viii) reviewed contracts awarded and disbursements projections for 2011; (ix) followed up on submission of draft bidding documents for the procurement of small-scale civil works and goods of remaining research institutes and schools; and (x) reviewed the Borrower's compliance with the loan covenants.

3. The Mission was concluded with a wrap-up meeting on 23 December 2010 in Hanoi, chaired by Mr. Nguyen Huu Khuong, Director General of Agricultural Project Management Board, and attended by staff of MARD and representatives of other government agencies/organizations/stakeholders. A list of persons met and those present at the wrap-up meeting is shown in Appendix 1.

---

<sup>1</sup> The Mission comprised of Sununtar Setboonsarng (Mission Leader)

4. This Aide Memoire records the findings of the Mission, and agreements reached between representatives of the Government and the Mission. Agreements reflected herein are subject to approval by higher authorities of the Government and ADB. The Government's confirmation of the Aide Memoire is requested by 31 January 2011.

## **II. BACKGROUND**

5. ADB approved the Loan on 11 December 2006 for SDR 20.198 million (US\$30 million equivalent) from ADB's Special Funds resources. The Loan Agreement became effective on 13 June 2007 with a loan closing date of 30 June 2012. The last loan review mission was fielded in September 2009.

6. The Project aims to strengthen the national agriculture science and technology (AST) system in Viet Nam, thereby contributing to the sustainable and equitable growth of the agriculture sector and ultimately to reduce rural poverty. The Project addresses critical issues involved in AST development, including the low level of linkages among key AST areas (agricultural research, extension, and training), and the gap in the capacity of physical and human resources for the national AST system. The Project contributes to the resolution of these issues and increase the effectiveness and relevance of AST activities for clients to receive benefits of improved AST, and promote on-farm and off-farm sustainable use of natural resources. Inclusion of the three key AST areas under the Project as part of the integrated national system is vital if the full potential of AST development is to be realized. The Project has four components namely (i) client-oriented agricultural research and capacity strengthening; (ii) grassroots agricultural extension improvement; (iii) rural-based technical and vocational training; and (iv) project management.

## **III. REVIEW OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION**

### **A. Overall Progress**

7. As of 30 November 2010, the overall progress of the Project is estimated at 68.6% against the elapsed time of 72% since loan approval (see Appendix 2). It should be noted that since its inception, the Project has been hampered by (i) a delay in consultant recruitment, (ii) slow start-up, (iii) delay in allocation of counterpart fund, (iv) slow process of approval of IPMUs and PPMU investment plans, and (v) weak capacity of IPMUs, PPMUs, and the CPMU. Despite the difficulties faced during the first 1.5 years of the project, significant progress has been noted since the last quarter of 2009. Implementation progress of each project component is as follows: component 1. client-oriented agricultural research and capacity strengthening, 76 %; component 2: grassroots agricultural extension improvement, 41 %; component 3: rural-based technical and vocational training, 69 %; and component 4: project management, 68 %. In 2010, contract awards and disbursement achieved 159% and 162% of the projection respectively, showing the increased effectiveness in project implementation.

8. With all project implementation mechanism in place in all project components, the focus of the project will now be on quality improvement to excel project activities. Early impacts of research and extension activities are showing positive results in poor farmers receiving more effective services using participatory approach at community level and adopting market mechanism in engaging extension services. Experiences from the project provide valuable lessons for MARD in implementing the nation-wide adoption of market-mechanism in the research and extension system. It is proposed that project impacts will be showcased at the



ADB Annual Meeting in Viet Nam in 2011. Contracts for small-scale civil works and equipment for the research institutes and technical vocational training schools are being implemented in an increasing efficient manner. Utilization of the equipment installed has been immediate and effective in most institutes and has even brought about significant financial benefits in providing laboratory services to the private sector.

8. Based on the request of the Government represented by the State Bank of Viet Nam (SBV), on 13 December 2011 ADB approved the extension of the loan closing date of the Project from 30 June 2012 to 30 June 2013 to allow: (i) some Ph.D. candidates to complete their studies before the proposed loan closing date; (ii) more time for transferring research results into the extension and preparation of about 30 training programs and curriculum revision so that the project impact would be maximize; and (iii) extract lessons in adoption of market mechanism in financing research and extension systems for public sector management. The loan extension was approved under the assurance that except for subcomponent on overseas training, all other components are still to target completion of activities close to original plan and that counterpart funds from the Provinces will be available in a timely manner..

9. With the loan extension recently approved and with the devaluation of Vietnamese Dong, the draft of revised project implementation plan has been prepared and is being finalized for approval. With the increased awareness that the agriculture sector is most vulnerable to climate change and that the potentials for poor farmers to participate in mitigating green house gas emission while adapting to climate change could be realized through project activities, the shared vision of a pro-poor and pro-climate change development framework should be further highlighted to guide and link activities in all project components. Improving linkages among project components, enhancing participation of private sector in curriculum development and extension activities, and implementing an effective monitoring system for all project activities remain to be the challenge to be overcome. Increased attention on implementation progress in Dak Nong Province and assurance of counterpart funds from all the provinces should be prioritized. Effective technical inputs from consultants, particularly from international consultants, continue to be a challenge in assuring quality of project activities.

## **B. Progress of Project Implementation**

9. The Mission reviewed the progress under each of the project components and discussed the timetable for planning and implementation of various activities for the remainder of the Project. A revised implementation schedule is attached in Appendix 3.

### **Component 1. Client-Oriented Agricultural Research and Capacity Strengthening**

10. **Client-Oriented Research Programs.** The Project promotes agricultural research programs and timely application of research results to clients' practical uses. Research proposals focusing on knowledge, information, and technologies relevant to the agro ecological regions serviced by regional research institutes are funded under the Project. DSTE continues to oversee activities under this sub-component.

11. A total of 125 research programs are ongoing. The first batch consisting of 58 projects was reviewed by independent reviewers in 2010. The results of the review ranked 3.7% of the research project as 'excellent', 83.3% as 'good', with the remaining 13% facing some difficulties due to floods, droughts, and problems in chemicals procurement. The second batch of the research projects are on-going with funds largely disbursed. The research projects are being

implemented with collaboration of farmers and extension workers. As of October, 2010, 3496 households have been participating in the research projects, of which 1600 were female headed households (46.12%), and 1191 households were ethnic minority (34.3%). 47 of 125 research projects (37.6%) are on environmental issues, safe food production, and climate change (erosion control, soil improvement, agro-chemicals, biodiversity conservation, organic farming, VietGap). The research projects are largely implemented based on schedule and many has shown promising early results. Many research projects of the first batch are approaching completion and are to be further evaluated for use in extension. Total numbers of participants of training courses organized by research projects were 5456 people. In which the number of extension staff was 461 people, 4995 of farmers, 2591 of women (accounting for 51.9%); and 1716 of ethnic minorities (accounting for 34.4 %).

## 12. Findings and Recommendations:

- Independent review of research projects in the first batch ranked 83% of the projects are good and only 3.7% as excellent. Main weaknesses include basic data reporting, distance of research project site from research institute render difficulties in effective monitoring, and effective collaborations with extension centers and farmers. Specific recommendations were provided by the reviewers for each individual research projects so it is expected that the weaknesses in each research project will be rectified. The Mission commended the use of independent reviewers to assess the projects and requested DSTE to follow up with researchers on implementing the recommendations from the reviewers in all research projects.
- The Mission observed that a number of research projects are focusing on developing indigenous species using environmental-friendly approach, utilizing agricultural waste, and are highly appropriate for the poor in upland areas.
- Not all research projects have effectively collected baseline information render it difficult to assess impacts. CPMU and DSTE are to assist researchers to improve baseline and monitoring system for effective reporting of research progress and potential impacts.
- Evaluation of success of research projects should not solely focus on yield improvement but also to highlight environmental and social impacts, including climate change impacts. The Mission has provided an initial list of criteria to CPMU and requested that CPMU work with DSTE and researchers to further develop a list of comprehensive criteria to evaluate success of research projects. The criteria are to be submitted to ADB by Q1 2011.
- Some research projects are introducing new species using chemical agriculture practices to upland ecosystems and to indigenous communities. The Mission requested that an action plan to improve environmental and social safeguard be developed by CPMU and DSTE for these projects and submit to ADB in Q2 2011.
- The research projects being implemented with farmer participation are researcher-managed on-farm trials for which all inputs are financed by the project. For research projects to be extended, an important step of farmer-managed on-farm trial is strictly required prior to evaluating the technology for extension. Research project which pass the evaluation of farmer-managed on-farm trials will be financed for extension.

- Workshops being organized by the project for researchers are beneficial in strengthening research network. The Mission recommended that DSTE use the opportunities during the workshops to enhance awareness of researchers on MARD's Climate Change Action Plan and SPS Action Plan. In future Workshop where technologies are to be evaluated for extension, the National Agricultural Extension Center(NAEC) and project staff responsible for extension should be invited to participated in the research workshop to improve linkage between research and extension components.

13. **Training of Research Staff.** The subcomponent addresses the shortage of qualified research staff by providing on-the-job training and postgraduate and postdoctoral study programs for the staff of agricultural research institutes and other institutions of the national AST system. The on-the-job trainings will enable staff to effectively utilize the existing and proposed laboratory equipment and facilities, and improve staff knowledge and skills to manage sophisticated facilities. DOP continues to oversee activities under this sub-component. The Mission endorse DOP's request for 2 overseas short-term training on food safety, climate change adaptation and organic/bio-intensive farming practices.

14. **Overseas Training.** The project target of supporting 55 students to study abroad has been achieved. The profile consists of 03 postdoc, 18 research students and 22 post-graduates, of which 24% are women. Twenty-two candidates are studying in Australia, 7 in U.S, 6 in Germany, 4 in the Netherlands, 4 in Japan, 5 in Thailand, 1 in Sweden, 1 in Denmark, 2 in UK, 1 in India, and 1 in Norway. Two post-doctoral trainee has completed their training and has returned to their respective institute to actively utilizing the knowledge gained in their works. With the extension of the project, all PhD students will be able to complete their studies within the project period.

15. **Findings and Recommendations:**

- With lower than estimated tuition fee in some universities in Europe, it is estimated that two more master degree students can be supported by the project. With the candidates already identified and accepted by the university under programs which will complete within project period, the Mission endorsed the request to use the surplus funds to finance two more students for overseas training.
- To enhance capacity of researchers and to provide incentives for researchers to excel, the Mission recommended that surplus funds could be used to finance researchers under the project to attend international conferences. The participation of the researchers should be based on the fact that their research abstracts are formally peer reviewed by the professional committee organizing the conferences.
- The Mission endorsed the request to use the surplus funds under this sub-component for sending researchers to overseas short-training course on climate-change related subject and organic/bio-intensive agriculture. On a case-by-case basis and as approved by the Project Steering Committee, management staff of MARD could participate in the overseas training courses.

16. **Local Training.** To date, a total of 38 training courses were conducted by the CPMU cooperated with Vietnam Academy of Agricultural Sciences (VAAS) for 930 research staff and laboratory managers from research institutes under the project and under VAAS network.



Forty-four percent of the trainees were women. The assessment results of 38 training courses showed that the training courses are well organized (87.5 to 100%) with the 75-100% of the contents meets the requirements and demands. The training courses on science research management and research project planning were highly rated (71.9 to 95%). Participants requested for longer period of training and more emphasis on improving analytical skills. Participants also requested for repeated course on some aspects such as sample processing methods, analyzing results skills, documental establishment, competitive research projects participation, research data analysis.

**18. Findings and Recommendations:**

- In the next Progress Report, the Mission requested that evaluation of training course be reported at three levels: (i) end of training course; (ii) six to 12 months after the course; and (iii) one year after the course.
- The Mission reiterated that training courses be centered on sustainable and equitable agriculture development which is the overall objective of the Project. In particular, training courses on climate change mitigation and adaptation for the poor, including the use of ICT in agriculture be increased during the remaining period of the project.

**19. Upgrading of Research and Laboratory Equipment.** The Project is providing and upgrading essential research and laboratory equipment of selected MARD agricultural research institutes to fill critical gaps in research due to outdated equipment. DSTE continues to oversee activities under this sub-component.

**20.** Twenty-nine procurement packages (comprising 14 contracts) out of 31 have been awarded and installed. Completion of installation and necessary trainings are expected to be completed in 2011. A summary of the status of the procurement of packages can be found in Appendix 4. Some delay has occurred due to the devaluation of exchange rate but corrective measures are being taken and it is expected that all procurements will be completed in early 2011. Check list for environmental safeguard for safe disposal of toxic waste from equipment has been developed by the project.

**22. Findings and Recommendations:**

- The Mission noted that equipment procured were effectively utilized with some institutes providing services to private sector and the public. The Mission recommend that as part of the project monitoring system, contribution from financial incomes arising from laboratory services be documented and be evaluated on its potential contribution in sustainable maintenance and upgrading of equipment beyond project period and importantly on its potential contribution to the implementation of the Decree 115 of the Government.
- CPMU is to continue to conduct spot check on environmental safeguard associated with the use of the equipments as well as monitoring the effective use and maintenance of the equipment.

**Component 2. Grassroots Agricultural Extension Improvement**

**24.** The Project is improving farmers' access to participatory and pro-poor extension services, and is strengthening linkages between agricultural research and extension services.



Activities are being implemented in Dak Nong, Nghe An, Ninh Thuan, Quang Nam, and Thanh Hoa provinces. NAEC continues to oversee activities under this component.

25. **Pro-poor Provincial Agricultural Extension Services.** This sub-component provides (i) ongoing technical training programs for local extension staff and farmer groups, and (ii) procurement of basic equipment and provision of support for incremental costs of the information and communication capacity and networks of NAEC, provincial agriculture extension centers, and district stations for agricultural extension.

26. Extension activities are on-going in all five provinces. Implementation progress of the provinces of Thanh Hoa and Nghe An are on track although counterpart funds remain an issue in Ninh Thuan. Progress in Dak Nong is still behind schedule with no effective measures in place to improve implementation progress. The previous recommendations for CPMU to provide intensive supervision and to engage private sector firms to develop niche products from this province has yet to be taken up.

27. A total of 45 extension staff from five provinces have undergone Training of Trainer (TOT). Only 5 or 9% of the TOT are female. A total of 624 training courses were conducted for 15,041 extension personnel. Of the 12,108 extension staff trained at the sub-district level, 21.3% were female and 23.9% were ethnic minorities. 66 training courses were organized for service providers with 1,719 participants of which 24.9% were female. 51 courses were organized for 1,214 provincial and district extension workers with 17% female participants. Evaluation of training course has been conducted by the CPMU with generally positive results.

28. Networks of exchange for extension workers has been established through an overseas study tour to Thailand and 6 in-country visits organized by 5 provinces—Thanh Hoa (2), Ninh Thuan (2), Dak Nong (1) and Nghe An (2)—for staff of PPMU, extension centers, and extension service agencies totaling 101 people. Training courses were conducted for 197 participants (44.2% female) agricultural extension staff at national and provincial levels to strengthen communication capacity.

29. CPMU and NAEC have developed communication program to use mass media in five provinces to disseminate information on subjects related to sustainable and equitable agriculture development. To date, 6 programs have been broadcasted on Vietnam Television from March to August 2010 and 7 programs have been broadcasted on Voice of Vietnam from May to Dec 2010. Contracts have also been awarded to Voice and Radio of provinces to produce extension programs in 2011.

30. Three PPMUs have conducted survey on indigenous knowledge in some project provinces in 2008-2009 but the survey results have not been properly utilized in the project activities.

### 31. **Findings and Recommendations:**

- Lack of counterpart funds from Ninh Thuan continue to cause delay in project activities. The Mission request MARD and other oversight agencies to take measures to assure availability of counterpart funds in all provinces, in particular for the period under the loan extension.
- Delay of project activities in Dak Nong requires serious attention from MARD and the CPMU. As a poor province with lower implementation capacity the Mission reiterated the previous recommendation for the CPMU to pay special attention to Dak Nong to identify

effective measures to resolve the outstanding issue of research institute which won the bid to implement the extension contracts decided not to sign the contract. The Mission also suggested the CPMU to explore the possibility of involving private sector firm such as Ecolink to develop niche market products such as organic coffee for export.

- Based on project design, NAEC is to oversee the overall implementation of this component. However, limited involvement has been noted, undermining to potential gains both for the beneficiaries and for NAEC in extracting lessons from this project for nation-wide activities. Continuous problems in fielding of the international extension specialist caused ineffective inputs for project activities. The Mission requested that CPMU expedite the consultant engagement and organize meeting to discuss and clarify the roles of NAEC in project activities. How NAEC could increase its role in overseeing the implementation of this component should be discussed at the next Project Steering Committee and the outcomes are to be reported to ADB in the next Project Progress Report.
- The quality of DVDs developed by the project could be improved. The Mission reiterated the previous recommendation that the international consultants be involved in the design and implementation of the program, in particular, in reviewing the contents, scripts of the DVD, and quality of production of various information packages. In particular, translation of DVD into English is to be done by qualified staff and checked by international consultant before releasing to the public. The contents of the information packages are to focus on promotion of safe food production, climate change mitigation, and climate change adaptation by the poor. At least one DVD be developed on opportunities for farmers to receive carbon credit from compost and biochar production. In addition to TV, radio, and website, the use of mobile phone and other ICT in pro-poor extension be included as one of the information dissemination means.
- Monitoring and evaluation of project training courses should be done systematically and feedbacks should be used in improving future training courses.
- Training on market-linkages for the poor, environmental and social implications of extension programs including certification program for organic, sustainable and biodiversity-friendly production are to be further enhanced. Pro-poor and pro-climate change agriculture extension and training materials developed under ADB TAs and other development partners are to be distributed to all PPMUs.
- Gender balance in TOT and in training activities needs to be improved. The Mission recommended that the Gender Action Plan of the project be effectively utilized and training on gender mainstreaming be organized by all PPMUs in 2011.

31. **Promotion of Extension Contracts.** The sub-component finances on-farm demonstration trials in the provinces through contractual arrangements with regional or national research institutes to strengthen the provincial links between research and extension.

32. As of November 2010, the five provinces are implementing 438 demonstration models and 25 pilot models (5.7% ) for which 193 models are in Thanh Hoa; 85 models are in Nghe An; 79 models are in Quang Nam; 60 are models in Ninh Thuan; and 21 models in Dak Nong; The demonstration models include 293 livestock models(67%), 111 crop production models (25.3%), and other types such as fisheries and mechanization of agriculture models account for 0.5-5%.

33. The models were developed in accordance with procedures issued by MARD on competitive bidding of the extension contracts. There have been 232 service providers participating in the bidding process in 5 project provinces, in which 125 service providers awarded the contracts to implement 449 extension models. In 2010, the project evaluated the effectiveness of the bidding process and evaluation of the service providers in Thanh Hoa and Ninh Thuan. The finding showed effective competition.

41. **Findings and Recommendations.** Evaluation study on the extension contract bidding process and capacity of service providers conducted by the CPMU was highly useful. The study should be widely shared among policy makers in MARD and should be utilized by NAEC in the implementation of nation-wide bidding of extension contract. The study showed that district extension centers won most of the bid in remote areas due to cost advantage. The Mission noted that the system could be further improved by facilitating joint contract between district extension centers and research institute to create synergism among those with locational advantage and technical advantage. The Mission requested the CPMU to explore feasibility of promoting joint contracts among different stakeholders.

42. The Mission noted that recommendations provided by previous review missions still need continued attention so listed again here as reminders:

- (i) Where feasible, contract farming schemes of safe food and environmentally friendly products (such as organic products) is to be promoted. Study tours for farmer leaders and TOT be organized to visit schemes organized by the Metro Supermarket and box schemes or organic vegetables organized by NGOs and social entrepreneurs in different locations in the country.
- (ii) Extension program for poor households is to adopt a holistic approach of empowering the households and not focusing only on yield improvement without consideration on market linkage. Other production-related issues such as i.e., processing, packaging, or marketing should be considered. For indigenous communities, production of high-value products for niche market is to be prioritized.
- (iii) Where demonstration plots are set up, letters of invitation to households to visit the demonstration plot should be addressed to the women at least once in the three formal visits under the Project. This will ensure that women will also benefit from the project activities.
- (iv) Additional training be conducted for extension workers and service providers on (i) gender mainstreaming, (ii) participatory method, (iii) climate change, environment, social, and health implications of agriculture technologies.
- (v) In all project activities, social and environmental safeguards are to be strictly implemented. Gender action plan are to be reflected in all activities under the Project.
- (vi) The system of information dissemination to farmers through ICT technologies in particular through mobile phone (SMS) be explored for the project. NAEC and CPMU are to review experiences of using SMS to send information to farmers and assess the feasibility of introducing into the Project.

### **Component 3. Rural-Based Technical and Vocational Training**

43. The capacity of ten rural-based technical and vocational training schools is being strengthened by (i) improving technical knowledge, teaching, and managerial skills of teachers and administrators and curricula; and (ii) upgrading library and laboratory equipment and



materials, teaching and laboratory facilities, and office equipment for school administration. DOP continues to oversee activities under this component.

44. The activities under this subcomponent are progressing with minor problems in 2010. Currently the 10 schools completed their development of 11 curricula with 96 sets of training materials. A workshop was organized in 5 August 2010 in Can Tho to select 19 additional curricula to be developed by the project. With the approval of the DOP on curriculum development plan in September 2010, the 10 schools have established the Curriculum Development Executive Board, involving private sector representative.

45. Training courses was organized under sub-component include:

- (i) 6 training courses on 'curriculum development for 156 administration officers in 10 schools, of which 57 are women (36.5%).
- (ii) 4 training courses on 'training by certificate' for 120 administrative officers of 10 schools, of which 23 are women (20%).

46. Workshops and seminars on development strategy for the 10 schools in the Project are being carried out. Course conducted include the following:

- (i) Three training courses on "Developing Training Curricula" for 70 participants (21.4% women).
- (ii) Four training courses on credit transfer system for 120 participants (19% women)
- (iii) Three training courses on compiling training materials for 86 participants (32.5% women).
- (iv) English training courses were organized at each of the 10 project schools for school leaders and teachers (15-20 participants in each schools).

47. Contracts have been awarded for the procurement of (i) small-scale civil works for the construction and renovation of classrooms, libraries, and laboratories; and (ii) school & laboratory equipment for the 10 training and vocational schools. Draft bidding documents and bid evaluation reports for the remaining packages continue to be prepared and submitted for ADB approval. To date, 41 packages (10 for civil works and 31 for equipment) have been awarded. Construction has been completed for nine schools while 31 equipment contracts have been delivered and installed. Completion of all installation and necessary trainings are expected in 2011. A summary of the status of the procurement of packages is in Appendix 5.

#### 48. Findings and Recommendations:

- The Mission note the lack of gender balance in all training and workshop activities organized under this sub-component. The Mission requested that DOP communicate to the 10 schools the need to mainstream gender balance in all activities including in the content of the 30 curriculum being developed under the project. CPMU is to spot check the quality of the curriculum being developed and to report to ADB in the next progress report on the followings:
  - (i) the extent of participation of agro-industry representatives in the curriculum development.

- (ii) evidence of incorporation of the following issues namely gender mainstreaming, climate change mitigation and adaptation, food safety, and environment, social, and health implications of agriculture technologies.
- The Mission endorsed the request to utilize project funds to digitize and to print the training materials developed.

#### **Component 4. Project Management**

49. The CPMU is the overall project management support, acting as the central contact and coordination point for the Project, and monitoring the progress of all components. There are five provincial project management units (PPMU) in five provinces and 20 institute project management units (IPMU) comprising ten research institutes and ten agricultural colleges & vocational schools implementing the various project activities.

50. The following highlights the Mission's findings and recommendations:

- (i) **Mistakes in Submissions from PPMUs and IPMUs.** Minor mistakes of submissions to ADB continue to be the cause of delay in project implementation. CPMU is to assure completion of documents prior to submit to ADB and to continue training PPMU and IPMU staff on preparation of financial documents to expedite project activities.
- (i) **Less than Effective Inputs of Some of the International Consultants.** Communication between consultants and CPMU has improved since the last review mission. Despite the limited inputs of international consultants, the national consultants under the project has performed effectively. However, the ineffective inputs from some international consultants has resulted in limited incorporation of international best practices in some project activities hampering the project to further excel as a flagship project. In the remaining period of the project, using the reallocated funds, inputs of international consultant should be carefully assessed and timeliness of fielding the all consultants should be assured.
- (ii) **Second Phase of AST Project.** The MARD has received clearance from the Prime Minister Office to request ADB to support a follow-up project, focusing on improving research capacity to address climate change. Utilizing the unallocated funds under the project, it was agreed that a small team of consultants will be engaged to prepare the follow-up project to be merged with the second phase of the Food Safety and Biogas Project for which a PPTA is on-going. This is to reduce number of projects while increasing the size of the new project.
- (iii) **Detailed Implementation Plan for the Loan Extension Period.** The CPMU has prepared a new Gantt chart of project implementation plan but has not prepared the detailed workplan, budget, and schedule of fielding of consultants. The Mission requested that a new workplan be submitted to ADB in January 2011. The possibility of engaging individual consultants is to be explored, given the difficulties in extending the contract of the existing consulting firm under Government's rule.

## D. Consulting Services

54. **Status of Consulting Firm Inputs.** As of 30 November 2010, contracts awarded is \$1.104 million (100.8% of budget allocation) and disbursement is \$0.632 million. Of the 152 person-months of consulting services inputs (29 international and 123 national), a total of 98.4 person-months (18.57 international and 79.83 national) have been utilized as of 30 November 2010, equivalent to 65%. The schedule of consultants' inputs is presented in Appendix 8.

55. The project implementation consultants were fielded 13 months after Loan approval. Until mobilization of the consulting firm in September 2008, administrative and technical support were provided to the CPMU under TA 4619.<sup>2</sup> Due partly to this, the consulting firm initially faced difficulties in providing effective inputs. The need to hold regular weekly meetings between CPMU, implementing agencies, and the consultants was stressed to update each other on key project issues and outcomes.

57. Quality of some experts provided by the firm has not been satisfactory. The Mission requested CPMU to discuss with the consulting firm on plan of deployment of project consultants and to submit the plan to ADB for approval in January 2011.

58. **Status of Individual Consultants.** As of 30 November 2010, the Project has engaged 7 national individual consultants (extension specialists for the 5 provinces, a training consultant, and a CPMU coordinator) for a total of 162 person-months input. To date, 144 person-months have been rendered (Appendix 8)

## E. Project Reporting

59. Quality of progress report has improved gradually. The Mission requested that the format of reporting include overall progress of project and details of progress under each component. For each component, overall financial and physical progress are to be reported, follow by summary of project activities during the reporting period, progress on indicators in the Development Monitoring Framework, and issues requiring attention. The progress report are to include brief summary of information from appendix, update of the loan covenants, update of the action plan for all activities under each component, computation of overall implementation progress, and an update on the list of items procured. A list of reports submitted and publications under the Project is shown in Appendix 9.

## F. Project Costs and Financing

60. **Contract Awards and Disbursement.** As of 30 November 2010, the CPMU reported total disbursement of VND 431 billions (approximately \$24 million) comprising of VND 323 billions (approximately \$18 million) of ADB funds and VND 108 billions (approximately \$ 6 million). A schedule showing overall project expenditure to date is in Appendix 10.

61. The status of ADB Loan utilization as of 30 November 2010 can be found in Appendix 11. As of 30 November 2010, the dollar-equivalent value of ADB's loan (SDR20.198 million) is \$30.904. The cumulative contract awards and disbursements of loan proceeds were \$14.8 million and \$15.6 million, respectively. The 2010 contract awards and disbursement projections

---

<sup>2</sup> ADB. 2005. *Technical Assistance to the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam for Strengthening Agriculture Science and Technology Management*. Manila (TA 4619-VIE).



are \$5.20 million and \$5.18 million and these have been achieved by 159% (\$8.284 million) and 162% (\$8.412 million).

62. **Audited Financial Statements.** Audit reports on project financial statements and accounts for fiscal years up to 2009 were prepared in time by the sovereign audit agency of the Government and no significant anomalies or discrepancies were noted. Issues noted by previous Audit report in 2008 were rectified by the CPMU.

63. **Counterpart Funds.** Of the VND 89 billion counterpart funding requirement reflected in the Project's projected expenditures for 2010, approximately VND 73 billion has been committed by the Central Government for expenditures covering Components 1, 3, and 4; while a total of approximately VND 16 billion has been committed by the five participating provinces for activities in Component 2.

64. Counterpart funds from CPMU has been sufficient for project implementation but counterpart funds from PPMUs faced difficulties in 2010. Counterpart funds allocation remains problematic in Ninh Thuan Province. In 2010, the Project Steering Committee authorized reallocation of project funds earmarked for these two provinces in 2009 to use in Thanh Hao and Nghe An, as these two provinces have more participating districts and have sufficient counterpart funds.

#### **G. Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation**

65. Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation System of the Project is yet to be fully operationalized. Increased attention by the CPMU has been noted but improvement is further required at the PPMUs and IPMUs level. Actions are being taken to compile baseline data and set up monitoring systems in all components.

#### **H. Environmental and Social Safeguards**

66. As the Project works largely in environmental and social sensitive areas, ADB safeguards should be strictly adhered to. Based on field visit during the Mission, awareness on social and environmental safeguards remains to be improved. The CPMU is to further enhance awareness to improve social and environmental requirements of research, extension and vocational training activities. Where documents are available in Vietnamese, such as the Project's gender action plan, as agreed between the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam and ADB, the CPMU is to make the documents available to all PPMU and IPMU staff.

#### **I. Compliance with Loan Covenants**

67. The Mission finds the loan covenants to be generally complied with. Insufficient counterpart funds being addressed by MARD. Weaknesses on gender, environment, and social safeguards are being rectified. Project Steering Committee is to meet twice a year, independent of other project activities i.e., wrap-up meeting of ADB Mission, to effectively guide and resolve issues on the Project. An updated schedule of covenants is given in Appendix 12.

### **IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

68. The Mission would like to thank MARD especially the following agencies: ICD, APMB, CPMU and the Consultants, DOF, DOP, DSTE, NAEC, SBV, NOMAFSI, for their help and

cooperation during the Mission's visit. The next loan review mission is tentatively scheduled for 2010.

Sununtar Setboonsarng  
Hanoi, Viet Nam  
23 December 2010

## **APPENDIX 1: LIST OF PERSONS MET**

### **1. CPMU & Consultants:**

#### **1.1 CPMU**

Nguyen The Hinh – Deputy Director of APMB - Director of CPMU  
Le Thi Nhung – Deputy Director of CPMU  
Vu Tien Dung – Deputy Director cum Head of Technical Division of CPMU  
Ha Thi Thu – Chief Accountant  
Duong Thi Diem Hang - Accountant  
Nguyen Ngoc Lau – Technical staff  
Trinh ThiThuy Hoi – Technical staff  
Nguyen Thi Minh Huong – Planning staff  
Nguyen Thi Viet Ha - Accountant staff  
Nguyen Thi Thanh Nga- Accountant staff  
Tran Diem My - Planning staff  
Nguyen Thi Thanh- Administration staff  
Nguyen Van Quy- Administration staff

#### **2.2 Consultants**

Nguyen Thi Lan – Deputy Team Leader, Domestic Research Management Consultant  
Nguyen The Con – Extension Management Domestic Consultant  
Le Nhu Quynh- Communication Consultant  
Nguyen Thi Loan- Enviromental Consultant  
Trinh Van Tien- Value Chain Consultant  
Do Thi Dung- Electronic Library Consultant

### **2. APMB:**

Nguyen Huu Khuong – Director of APMB

### **3. DSTE:**

Nguyen Tan Hinh – Vice Director of DSTE  
Tran Thi Dinh – Staff

### **4. DOP:**

Pham Hung- Vice Director of DOP  
Phung Huu Cần – Staff

### **5. NAFEC:**

Dr. Phung Quoc Quang, Deputy Director of NAEC  
Mr Nguyen Van Chung, NAEC's staff  
Ms Vu Thi Thuy – NAFEC staff  
Mr Doan Quang Chien

### **6. NOMAFSI**

Do Huu Ngoc- Deputy Director of NOMAFSI  
Nguyen Huu La- Head of Science and international cooperation  
Nguyen Thi Thanh Thuy- Deputy Head of Science and international cooperation  
Nguyen Quang Tin- Project leader



Ngo Xuan Cuong- Project leader  
Nguyen Thi Ngoc Binh- Project leader  
Nguyen Doan Hung- Project Staff  
Nguyen Duc Thuan- Project leader  
Tran Thuy Ngo- Project Staff  
Vu Thong Nhat - Project Staff  
Le Viet Hai- Project Staff  
Pham Van Thuy- Farmer- Khai Xuan Commune- Thanh Ba District-  
Phu Tho Province.

#### **7. FSIV**

Dang Quang Hung- Project leader  
Han Trong Lam- Farmer- Di Nau Commune- Tam Nong District- Phu  
Tho Province.  
Chu Thi Thuy- Farmer- Di Nau Commune- Tam Nong District- Phu Tho  
Province.

#### **8. NIMM**

Nguyen Van Tap- Project leader  
Nguyen Quynh Nga- Project Staff  
Nguyen Van Dan- Project Staff  
Trieu Thi Binh- Farmer- Quan Chu Commune- Dai Tu District- Thai  
Nguyen Province  
Nguyen Thi Bich- Farmer- Quan Chu Commune- Dai Tu District- Thai  
Nguyen Province  
Trieu Thi Mui- Farmer- Quan Chu Commune- Dai Tu District- Thai  
Nguyen Province  
Trieu Tien Suu- Farmer- Quan Chu Commune- Dai Tu District- Thai  
Nguyen Province  
Trieu Hong Van- Commune staff - Quan Chu Commune- Dai Tu  
District- Thai Nguyen Province

#### **9. THAI NGUYEN UNIVERSITY**

Dang Van Minh- Project leader  
Dao Van Nui- Project Staff  
Nguyen Van Tien- Farmer- Trai Cau Commune- Dai Tu District- Thai  
Nguyen Province

#### **10. IAE**

Nguyen Hong Son- Director of IAE- Project leader  
Nguyen Viet The- Head of Science and international cooperation  
Pham Thi Lan- Project Staff  
Tran Hoang Anh- Project Staff  
Nguyen Tien Hung- Director of Big Green company  
Nguyen Doc Ngu- Director of Ecoling company

#### **17. ADB Viet Nam Resident Mission**

Ayumi Konishi-Country Director  
Yumiko Tamura – VRM

Vo Truc Dien – VRM

**18. Wrap-up meeting**

**APMB:**

Nguyen Huu Khuong – Director of APMB

**CPMU**

Nguyen The Hinh – Deputy Director of APMB - Director of CPMU

Le Thi Nhung – Deputy Director of CPMU

Vu Tien Dung – Deputy Director cum Head of Technical Division of CPMU

Ha Thi Thu – Chief Accountant

Duong Thi Diem Hang - Accountant

Nguyen Ngoc Lau – Technical staff

Trinh ThiThuy Hoi – Technical staff

Nguyen Thi Minh Huong – Planning staff

Nguyen Thi Viet Ha - Accountant staff

Nguyen Thi Thanh Nga- Accountant staff

Tran Diem My - Planning staff

Nguyen Thi Thanh- Administration staff

Nguyen Van Quy- Administration staff

**DSTE**

Tran Thi Dinh – Staff

**DOP**

Pham Hung- Vice Director of DOP

Phung Huu Can – Staff

**DOF**

Nguyen Van Hung – Staff

**ICD**

Ho Thi Minh Chau

**MOF**

Dao Thi Hop

**SBV**

Nguyen Quynh Phuong

## Physical Progress Computation as of 15 April 2010

	Weight	Score	Progress
<b>1. Client-oriented Research and Capacity Strengthening</b>			<b>17</b>
1.1. Client-oriented Research Programs	38	13.68	
- selection process	10	10	
- research activities	80	28	
- final report	10	0	
1.2. Training of Research Staff		11.88	
1.2.1. Overseas	44		
- selection process	10	8	
- study	80	35	
- certification	10	1	
1.2.2. Domestic			
- courses			
- participants			
1.3. Upgrading of Laboratory Equipment f research institutes	34	12.58	
- procurement process	10	9	
- installment	50	25	
- utilization	40	0	
		38.14	
<b>2. Grassroots Agriculture Extension Improvement</b>	<b>22</b>		<b>10</b>
2.1. Strengthening of Pro-poor Provincial Agricultural Extension Services			
2.1.1. national			
- provincial			
number of provincial staff			
- trainers	40	45	
- participants	100	100	
packages of training	270	100	
persons day spent for the training	1000	400	
2.1.2. districts			
- number of district staff	400	150	
- number of training courses	270	100	
- number of person days	1000	200	
2.1.3. commune			
- number of communes served	1500	300	
- number of potential services providers	5500	1000	
2.2. Promotion of extension contracts			
- number of communes served	500	150	
- number of household beneficiaries served	50000	1000	
- number of contract awards for commune services			
- value of total contracts awarded (\$)			
<b>Rural -based Technical and Vocational training</b>	<b>25</b>		<b>11</b>
3.1. Teaching Management & Curricula Improvement			
- curricula development			
- capacity building f teachers/managers			
- number of participants			
- persons day of training/workshop/study tours			
3.2. Upgrade library and other Infrastructure	100	23	
- procurement process	10	8	
- installment/construction	50	15	
- utilization	40	0	
<b>4. Project Management Support</b>		10	<b>5</b>
- Project generic staff	673		
- Consulting staff	1654		
- vehicle/equipments	209		
- Operation, monitoring/supervision	652		
<b>Overall</b>			<b>43</b>



## Physical Progress Computation as of December 2010

Components/Activities	Activity Progress			Subcomponent Progress		Component Progress	
	Weight	Progress (0 to 100)	Weighted Progress	Weight	Weighted Progress	Weight	Weighted Progress
<b>I. Client-oriented Agricultural Research and Capacity Strengthening</b>					77.48	43.94%	34.04
Client-oriented agricultural research programs			100.00	34.95%	34.95		
a. Identification of research needs	36.36%	100	36.36				
b. Procurement of needed materials and equipment	15.15%	100	15.15				
c. Use of research funds for selected programs	48.48%	100	48.48				
Training and post-graduate programs			89.33	29.14%	26.03		
a. Preparation of programs	13.33%	100	13.33				
b. Application and selection	33.33%	100	33.33				
c. Program implementation	53.33%	80	42.67				
Upgrading of equipment			45.94	35.91%	16.50		
a. Equipment specification and tendering	34.38%	90	30.94				
b. Procurement and installation	28.13%	40	11.25				
c. Training for equipment use and maintenance	37.50%	10	3.75				
<b>II. Grassroots Agricultural Extension Improvement</b>					78.05	21.76%	16.98
Provincial plans for pro-poor agricultural extension services	100.00%	100	100.00	20.00%	20.00		
Training programs for trainers, extension staff, and grassroots service providers			67.27	40.35%	27.15		
a. Extension module development	11.36%	80	9.09				
b. Preparation of programs	25.00%	80	20.00				
c. Application and selection	27.27%	60	16.36				
d. Program implementation	36.36%	60	21.82				
Provision of on-farm demonstration trials	100.00%	80	80.00	3.52%	2.82		
Contractual agricultural extension services			77.50	35.74%	27.70		
a. Establishment of a contractual management system	25.00%	100	25.00				
b. Extension contracts	75.00%	70	52.50				
Capacity strengthening of local extension centers			100.00	0.39%	0.39		
a. Equipment specification and tendering	36.36%	100	36.36				
b. Procurement and installation	63.64%	100	63.64				
<b>III. Rural-based Technical and Vocational Training</b>					46.79	25.25%	11.81
Training programs for teaching and administrative staff			74.40	3.48%	2.59		
a. Preparation of programs	20.00%	100	20.00				
b. Application and selection	32.00%	100	32.00				
c. Program implementation	32.00%	40	12.80				
d. Support for developing curriculum guides	16.00%	60	9.60				
Upgrading of library and laboratory facilities			45.79	96.52%	44.19		
a. Equipment specification and tendering	26.32%	90	23.68				
b. Procurement and installation	36.84%	50	18.42				
c. Training for equipment use and maintenance	36.84%	10	3.68				
<b>IV. Project Management Support</b>			64.00			9.05%	5.79
Establishment of provincial/institute project management units	10.00%	100	10.00				
Recruitment of implementation consultants	10.00%	100	10.00				
Procurement of vehicles and equipment	10.00%	100	10.00				
Appointment of incremental project staff	10.00%	100	10.00				
Establishment of a project steering committee	10.00%	100	10.00				
Monitoring of project activities	10.00%	50	5.00				
Financial auditing	10.00%	40	4.00				
Quarterly progress reporting	10.00%	40	4.00				
Midterm review	10.00%	10	1.00				
Project Completion Review	10.00%	0	0.00				
<b>Overall Progress (%)</b>							<b>68.63</b>

## REVISED PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION SCHEDULE

## APPENDIX 3: REVISED PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION SCHEDULE DECEMBER 2

Item	2007				2008				2009				2010				2011			
	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
<b>A. Client-oriented Agricultural Research and Capacity Strengthening</b>																				
Client-oriented agricultural research programs																				
- Identification of research needs																				
- Procurement of needed materials and equipment																				
- Use of research funds for selected programs																				
Training and post-graduate programs																				
- Preparation of programs																				
- Application and selection																				
- Program implementation																				
Upgrading of equipment																				
- Equipment specification and tendering																				
- Procurement and installation																				
- Training for equipment use and maintenance																				
<b>B. Grassroots Agricultural Extension Improvement</b>																				
Provincial plans for pro-poor agricultural extension services																				
Training programs for trainers, extension staff, and grassroots service providers																				
- Extension module development																				
- Preparation of programs																				
- Application and selection																				
- Program implementation																				
Provision of on-farm demonstration trials																				
Contractual agricultural extension services																				
- Establishment of a contractual management system																				
- Extension contracts																				
Capacity strengthening of local extension centers																				
- Equipment specification and tendering																				
- Procurement and installation																				
<b>C Rural-based Technical and Vocational Training</b>																				
Training programs for teaching and administrative staff																				
- Preparation of programs																				
- Application and selection																				
- Program implementation																				
- Support for developing curriculum guides																				
Upgrading of library and laboratory facilities																				
- Equipment specification and tendering																				
- Procurement and installation																				
- Training for equipment use and maintenance																				
<b>D Project Management Support</b>																				
Establishment of provincial project management units																				
Recruitment of implementation consultants																				
Procurement of vehicles and equipment																				
Appointment of incremental project staff																				
Establishment of a project steering committee																				
Monitoring of project activities																				
Financial auditing																				
Quarterly progress reporting																				
Midterm review																				
Project completion review																				

■ Timing of project activities.  
 ■ Intermittent or continuous activities.

**APPENDIX 4: PROCUREMENT OF CIVIL WORKS, GOODS, AND SERVICES**  
**DECEMBER 2010**  
(\$ '000)

<b>Component</b>		<b>Appraisal Estimates</b>	<b>Procured to date</b>	<b>Percentage Achieved (%)</b>
1	Client-Oriented Agricultural Research and Capacity Strengthening			
	Civil Works	53	-	0.00
	Equipment	3,380	2,530	74.85
	Materials	1,811	856	47.27
	Training	4,994	3,780	75.69
	Research and Extension Contracts	5,500	4,820	87.64
2	Grassroots Agricultural Extension Improvement			
	Equipment	221	224	101.36
	Materials	142	42	29.58
	Training	2,814	1,360	48.33
	Research and Extension Contracts	4,582	1,574	34.35
3	Rural-Based Technical and Vocational Training			
	Civil Works	1,549	920	59.39
	Equipment	6,338	4,530	71.47
	Materials	843	356	42.23
	Training	315	458	145.40
4	Project Management Support			
	Equipment	151	120	79.47
	Vehicles	72	21	29.17
	Materials	33	23	69.70
	Consulting Services	982	676	68.84
<b>Total</b>		<b>33,780</b>	<b>22,290</b>	<b>65.99</b>



**APPENDIX 5: SUMMARY OF PROCUREMENT STATUS AT INSTITUTES**  
(As of December 2010)

INSTITUTE	BIDDING PACKAGE NO.	PACKAGE VALUE (USD)	STATUS	EXPECTED TIME TO SEND TO ABD FOR PAYMENT
<b>I. CONSTRUCTION</b>				
1			No construction bid at 10 Institutes	
<b>II. PROCUREMENT</b>				
1 Soils And Fertilizers Research Institute	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 1 (Lots 1 &amp; 2)</li> <li>• Package 2</li> <li>• Package 3</li> <li>• Package 4</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 330,038</li> <li>• 186,197</li> <li>• 140,000</li> <li>• 33,550</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 25/5/2010</li> <li>• 10/6/2010</li> <li>• 15/6/2010</li> <li>• 25/10/2010</li> </ul>
a Northern Mountainous Agriculture And Forestry Science Institute	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 1</li> <li>• Package 2</li> <li>• Package 3</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 560,869</li> <li>• 278,000</li> <li>• 227,250</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 5/6/2010</li> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> <li>• 23/7/2010</li> </ul>
3 Forest Science Institute Of Vietnam	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 1</li> <li>• Package 2</li> <li>• Package 3</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 186,229</li> <li>• 183,000</li> <li>• 41,700</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/6/2010</li> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> <li>• 10/11/2010</li> </ul>
4 Foodcrops Research Institute	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 1 (Lots 1-4)</li> <li>• Package 2</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 375,381</li> <li>• 70,438</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 20/6/2010</li> <li>• 30/6/2010</li> </ul>

INSTITUTE	BIDDING PACKAGE NO.	PACKAGE VALUE (USD)	STATUS	EXPECTED TIME TO SEND TO ABD FOR PAYMENT
			instalation	
5 Plant Protection Institute	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 1</li> <li>• Package 2 (Lots 1 &amp; 2)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 186,875</li> <li>• 232,748</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 5/6/2010</li> <li>• 20/10/2010</li> </ul>
6 Mekong Delta Rice Research Institute (Can Tho)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 1</li> <li>• Package 3</li> <li>• Package 4</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 118,800</li> <li>• 173,000</li> <li>• 161,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 10/9/2010</li> <li>• 12/11/2010</li> <li>• 20/11/2010</li> </ul>
7 Southern Agricultural Science & Technology Institute (HCMC)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package1</li> <li>• Package2</li> <li>• Package 3</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 38,582</li> <li>• 97,794</li> <li>• 228,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, being installation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/9/2010</li> <li>• 15/9/2010</li> <li>• 21/12/2010</li> </ul>
8 Institute Of Policy And Strategy For Agriculture And Rural Development , Ha Noi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 1A</li> <li>• Package 1B</li> <li>• Package 2</li> <li>• Package 3</li> <li>• Package 4</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 65.349</li> <li>• 187.198</li> <li>• 150,000</li> <li>• 145,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scheduled for bidding in 2011</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/11/2010</li> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> <li>• 15/11/2010</li> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> </ul>
9 Southern Fruit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 169,211</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> </ul>

INSTITUTE		BIDDING PACKAGE NO.	PACKAGE VALUE (USD)	STATUS	EXPECTED TIME TO SEND TO ABD FOR PAYMENT
Research Institute (HCMC)		1 • Package 2	• 140,969	completed instalation • Awarded, completed instalation	• 15/7/2010
10	Central Highland Agro-Forestry Science And Technology Institute (Dak Lak)	• Package 1 • Package 2	• 83,000 • 93,625	• Awarded, completed instalation • Awarded, completed instalation	• 30/8/2010 • 15/10/2010
11	Agricultural Environmental Research Institute	• Package 11	• 372.706	• Awarded, completed instalation	• 30/12/2010
12	Northern Central Region Agricultural Science Institute	• Package 16	• 350,000	• Bid opening on 20 Dec2010	• 15/2/2011



**APPENDIX 6: SUMMARY OF PROCUREMENT STATUS AT SCHOOLS**  
(As of December 2010)

NAME OF SCHOOL	BIDDING PACKAGE NO.	PACKAGE VALUE (USD)	STATUS	EXPECTED TIME TO SEND TO ABD FOR PAYMENT
<b>I. CONSTRUCTION</b>				
1 Central Region College Of Technology, Economics And Water Resources, Quang Nam	• Package 3	• 119,408	• Awarded, completed construction	• 15/7/2010
2 Northern College Of Agriculture & Rural Development , Ha Tay	• Package XL3	• 221,439	• Awarded, completed construction	• 22/8/2010
3 College Of Food Industry, Da Nang	• Package 3	• 153,043	• Awarded, completed construction	• 27/7/2010
4 Secondary Technical School For Food & Foodstuff Management, Hai Phong	• Package XL	• 91,839	• Awarded, completed construction	• 7/7/2010
5 Ha Noi Technology & Economics Vocational School, Ha Noi	• Package XL3	• 184,434	• Awarded, completed construction	• 26/6/2010
6 Northern Water Resources College, Ha Nam	• Package 3	• 117,204	• Awarded, completed construction	• 25/6/2010
7 Bao Loc Technology & Economics College, Lam Dong	• Package 3	• 416,244	• Awarded, completed construction	• 30/9/2010
8 Southern Agricultural College, Tien Giang	• Package XL	• 14,869	• Awarded, completed construction	• 21/10/2010
9 Southern College For Engineering & Agriculture, Can Tho	• Package 3	• 81,063	• Awarded, completed construction	• 8/7/2010

	NAME OF SCHOOL	BIDDING PACKAGE NO.	PACKAGE VALUE (USD)	STATUS	EXPECTED TIME TO SEND TO ABD FOR PAYMENT
10	Food & Foodstuff Technical School , HCM City	• Package 3	• 104,000	• Awarded, being construction	• 15/3/2011
<b>II. PROCUREMENT</b>					
1	Northern Water Resources College, Ha Nam	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 4</li> <li>• Package 6</li> <li>• Package 05</li> <li>• Package 07</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 174,978</li> <li>• 120,985</li> <li>• 252,000</li> <li>• 8,474</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 25/6/2010</li> <li>• 19/6/2010</li> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> <li>• 15/6/2010</li> </ul>
2	Southern College For Engineering & Agriculture, Can Tho	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 4</li> <li>• Package 5</li> <li>• Package 6</li> <li>• Package 7</li> <li>• Package 8</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 64,820</li> <li>• 169,969</li> <li>• 172,734</li> <li>• 127,781</li> <li>• 167,500</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> </ul>
3	Central Region College Of Technology, Economics And Water Resources, Quang Nam	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 04</li> <li>• Package 5</li> <li>• Package 06</li> <li>• Package 07</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 97,300</li> <li>• 166,861</li> <li>• 35,772</li> <li>• 39,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, being instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> <li>• 29/8/2010</li> <li>• 25/8/2010</li> <li>• 21/1/2010</li> </ul>

NAME OF SCHOOL	BIDDING PACKAGE NO.	PACKAGE VALUE (USD)	STATUS	EXPECTED TIME TO SEND TO ADD FOR PAYMENT
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 08</li> <li>• Package 09</li> <li>• Package 10</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scheduled in 2011</li> <li>• Scheduled in 2011</li> <li>• Scheduled in 2011</li> </ul>	
4 Northern College Of Agriculture & Rural Development, Ha Tay	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 4</li> <li>• Package 5</li> <li>• Package 06</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 175,000</li> <li>• 322,000</li> <li>• 127,800</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 30/10/2010</li> <li>• 30/7/2010</li> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> </ul>
5 College Of Food Industry, Da Nang	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 4</li> <li>• Package 05</li> <li>• Package 06</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 234,854</li> <li>• 506,700</li> <li>• 172,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2/9/2010</li> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> </ul>
6 Secondary Technical School For Food & Foodstuff Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 4</li> <li>• Package 5</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 297,296</li> <li>• 232,849</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/6/2010</li> <li>• 16/9/2010</li> </ul>
7 Ha Noi Technology & Economics Vocational School, Ha Noi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 4</li> <li>• Package 5</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 353,684</li> <li>• 134,495</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 9/10/2010</li> <li>• 9/10/2010</li> </ul>
8 Bao Loc Technology & Economics College,	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Package 4</li> <li>• Package</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 100,014</li> <li>• 115,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Awarded, completed instalation</li> <li>• Awarded,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15/7/2010</li> <li>• 15/12/2010</li> </ul>



NAME OF SCHOOL		BIDDING PACKAGE NO.	PACKAGE VALUE (USD)	STATUS	EXPECTED TIME TO SEND TO ABD FOR PAYMENT
Lam Dong		05		completed instalation	• 30/12/2010
		• Package 06	• 128,000	• Awarded, completed instalation	
		• Package 07	• 220,000	• Awarded, completed instalation	• 30/12/2010
		• Package 08	• 95,000	• Scheduled in 2011	• 15/4/2011
9	Southern Agricultural College, Tien Giang	• Package 4, • Package 5	• 245,724 • 216,000	• Awarded, completed instalation • Awarded, completed instalation	• 15/12/2010 • 5/9/2010
		• Package 06, 07, 08, 09		• ADB approved bid dossiers, being advertised	• 15/2/2011
10	Food & Foodstuff Technical School, HCM City	• Package 04	• 27,395	• Awarded, completed instalation	• 30/6/2010
		• Package 05	• 166,700	• Awarded, completed instalation	• 15/10/2010
		• Package 06		• Scheduled in 2011	• 15/12/2010
		• Package 07		• Scheduled in 2011	

## REVISED PROCUREMENT PLAN

### Project Information

Country	Viet Nam
Name of Borrower	Socialist Republic of Viet Nam
Project Name	Agriculture Science and Technology Project
Loan or TA Reference	2283-VIE
Date of Effectiveness	13 June 2007
Amount \$ (total from all financiers):	\$40 million
Of which Committed, \$	\$30 million
Executing Agency	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
Approval Date of Original Procurement Plan	13 June 2007
Approval of Most Recent Procurement Plan	Not applicable
Period Covered by this Plan	2006 – 2013

### Procurement Thresholds, Goods & Related Services, Works and Supply & Install

Procurement Methods	To be used above/below (\$)
ICB works	At least \$1,000,000
ICB goods	At least \$500,000
NCB works	Less than \$1,000,000 but more than \$100,000
NCB goods	Less than \$500,000 but more than \$100,000
Shopping Works	Less than \$100,000
Shopping Goods	Less than \$100,000

### Procurement Thresholds, Consultants Services

Procurement Methods	To be used above/below (\$)
Quality- and Cost-Based Selection (QCBS)	At least \$200,000
Consultants Qualifications Selection (CQS)	Less than \$200,000
Least Cost Selection (LCS)	Less than \$100,000

### List of Major Contract Packages, Goods, Works and Consulting Services

Ref	Contract Description	Estimated Costs (\$)	Procurement Methods	Date of First Advertisement	Prior Review Y/N	Comments
<b>Client-Oriented Agricultural Research and Capacity Strengthening</b>						
1	Equipment and Materials	5,274,000 (48 packages)	NCB/SP	4th Quarter 07	Y	Financed by ADB
2	Research Contracts	4,220,000 (125 contracts)	NCB	3 <sup>rd</sup> Quarter 08	Y	Financed by ADB
3	Training – University <sup>a</sup>	3,889,000 (55 packages)	DC	4th Quarter 07	Y	Financed by ADB
4	Training – Non-university	740,000 (52 packages)	DC	1st Quarter 09	Y	Financed by ADB

<b>Grassroots Agricultural Extension Improvement</b>						
5	Equipment and Materials	349,000 (18 packages)	NCB/SP	3rd Quarter 07	Y	Financed by ADB
6	Extension Service Contracts	4,175,000 (612 packages) <sup>b</sup>	NCB	4th Quarter 08	N	Financed by ADB
<b>Rural-Based Technical and Vocational Training</b>						
7	Civil Works	1,333,000 (14 packages)	NCB/SP	3rd Quarter 09	Y	Financed by ADB
8	Equipment and Materials	7,234,000 (51 packages)	NCB/SP	4th Quarter 07	Y	Financed by ADB
<b>Project Management Support</b>						
9	Equipment, Materials and Vehicle	378,000 (6 packages)	NCB/SP	3rd Quarter 07	Y	Financed by ADB
10	Consulting Services	1,350,000 (2 packages)	QCBS	2nd Quarter 07	Y	Financed by ADB
11	Auditing Services	83,000 (1 package)	QCBS	2nd Quarter 09	Y	Financed by ADB

DC = direct contracting; LCS = lease cost selection; NCB = national competitive bidding; QCBS = quality- and cost-based selection; SP = shopping.

<sup>a</sup> Training activities include overseas postgraduate study and post-doctoral programs.

<sup>b</sup> Maximum contract amount is \$10,000.

<sup>d</sup> One contract to audit project accounts for 5 years.

Source: Revised as discussed during the May 2010 Midterm Review Mission.

Appendix 8 : Status of Consulting Services from September 2008 to 30 November 2010

No	Name	Position	Contracted (person- months)	Utilized (days)	Utilized (person months)	%	Balance (person- months)	Remarks
<b>Consultants contracted to Hassall &amp; Associates International</b>								
1	Michael John Blyth	Team Leader- International Agricultural Research Management Specialist	16	357	11.90	74	4.10	
2	Nick Shirra	International Agricultural Extension Management Specialist	5	50	1.67	35	3.33	Commenced 01-Dec- 2009; withdrew 30 April 2010
3	Dr. Michael THAIR	International Agricultural Vocational Training Specialist	1	4	0.13	13	0.87	Position ceased after first input; balance of budget redistributed to travel and translation
4	Evelyn Buenaventura	International Social Development Specialist	2	58	1.93	97	0.07	Completed
5	David Carpenter ®	International Environmental Assessment Specialist	2	0	0.00	0	2.00	Withdrew 30 April 2010
6	Myrna J. Hernandez(Ms.)	International Financial Management Specialist	1	28	0.93	93	0.07	Completed
7	Wang Dehai	International Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist	2	60	2.00	43	0.00	Commenced 21-March 2010; finish 19 May 2010
<b>Consultants contracted to VICA International</b>								
1	NGUYEN Thi Lan (Ms)	Deputy Team leader- National Agricultural Research Management Specialist	34	562	25.55	75	8.45	
2	Dr NGUYEN The Con	National Agricultural Extension Management Specialist	22	467	21.23	96	0.77	



3	Dr VUONG Thanh Huong	National Agricultural Vocational Training Specialist	11	241	10.95	100	0.05	Completed 19-04-2010
4	NGUYEN Thi Huong Tra (Ms)	National Social Development Specialist	6	92	4.18	70	1.82	Commenced 01-Dec-2010
5	Dr NGUYEN Thi Loan	National Environmental Management Specialist	11	151	6.86	62	4.14	Commenced 01-Dec-2010
6	Ha Thi Cam	National Financial Management Specialist	8	76.5	3.48	43	4.52	
7	Dr NGUYEN Tu Siem	National Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist	4	88	4.00	100	0.00	Completed 19/4/2010
8	DAO Van Khang	Nation Extension Communication Specialist	2	44	2.00	100	0.00	Commenced 12-April 2010 and completed on 27 July 2010
9	Trinh Van Tien	National Value Chain Development Specialist	6	8	0.36	6%	5.6	Commenced 19 Nov 2010
	Do Thi Dung	National E-library Action Plan Development Specialist	3	7	0.32	11%	2.7	Commenced 22 Nov 2010
	Le Nhu Quynh	National Communication Specialist	11	4	0.18	2%	10.8	Commenced 25 Nov 2010
	Tran Thi Thu Ha	National Team Leader/ Baseline Survey and Project Evaluation Specialist	3	8	0.36	12%	2.6	Commenced 19 Nov 2010
	Hoang Anh Tuan	National Researcher	2	8	0.36	18%	1.6	Commenced 19 Nov 2010
	Total		152	2313.5	98.4	65%	53.6	
	<b>CPMU and PPMU</b>							
1	Nguyen Van Chien	Coordination Specialist	24	672	24	100	0	Completed
2	Nguyen Van Hien	Training Specialist	24	672	24	100	0	Completed
3	Tran Van Cuong	Agricultural Extension Specialist	24	672	24	100	0	Completed
4	Nguyen Van Nhu	Agricultural Extension Specialist	24	672	24	100		Completed
5	Nguyen Quang Dong	Agricultural Extension Specialist	24	672	24	100	0	Completed

6	Nguyen Phuong Nghi	Agricultural Extension Specialist	24	672	24	100	0	Completed
7	Nguyen Dung Tien	Agricultural Extension Specialist	24	132	6	25	18	
	Total		162	4162	144		18	

**Notes:** Person days per month for International Consultant is 30  
Person days per month for National Consultant is 22

**APPENDIX 9: SUMMARY OF PROJECT REPORTS AND PUBLICATIONS BY AST PROJECT CONSULTANTS  
FROM SEPTEMBER 2008 TO 30 NOVEMBER 2010**

No	Document Title	Component	Date submitted to CPMU/ADB	Quantity of reports	Total Pages	Language E: English V: Vietnamese	Current Status
	<b>Reports</b>						
1	Stock-take report for ADB October 2008 Loan Review Mission	All	25/11/2008	1		E	Final
2	Inception Report	All	3/3/2009	1	108	E, V	Final
3	Monthly reports from September 2008 to March 2010	All	5 <sup>th</sup> -15 <sup>th</sup> day of following month	19	10-15	E, V	Final
4	4 <sup>th</sup> Quarter report (9-12/2008)	All	15/1/2009	1	21	E, V	Final
5	1 <sup>st</sup> Quarter report (1-3/2009)	All	12/4/2009	1	19	E, V	Final
6	3 <sup>rd</sup> Quarter report (7-9/2009)	All	15/10/2009	1	21	E, V	Final
7	Semi-annual report (1-6/2009)	All	25/9/2009	1	24	E, V	Final
8	2009 annual report (1-12/2009)	All	20/3/2010	1	35	E, V	Draft
9	International Social Development Specialist's Report	Social Development	23/12/2008	1	56	E, V	Final
10	International Financial Management Specialist's Report	Financial Management	10/12/2008	1	27	E, V	Final
11	International Extension Management Specialist's Report	2	25/2/2009	1	44	E, V	Final
12	International Agricultural Vocational Training Specialist's Report	3	25/12/2008	1	7	E, V	No feedback
13	Progress Report on monitoring and supporting training courses	1	6/7/2009	1	12	E, V	Final

No	Document Title	Component	Date submitted to CPMU/ADB	Quantity of reports	Total Pages	Language E: English V: Vietnamese	Current Status
14	Agricultural Research Management Specialist's field trip report in southern region	1	27/7/2009	1	8	V	Final
15	Monitoring Report on training of Subcomponent 3.1	3	8/2009	1	20	V	Final
16	Agricultural Research Management Specialist's field trip reports and minutes on Research project monitoring	1	15/12/2009	6	5	V	Final
17	Field trip Report by National Environmental Assessment Specialist, Ninh Thuan	2	24/12/2009	1	6	V	Final
18	Field trip report by National Social Development Specialist to Ninh Thuan	2	24/12/2009	1	6	V	Final
19	Field trip report by International Agricultural Extension Management Specialist – Quang Nam and Ninh Thuan	2	24/12/2009	1	14	E, V	Final
<b>Other Documents</b>							
1	M&E Formats for Institutes, Schools & Provinces	All	26/2/2009	1	12	E, V	Final
2	M&E Tables	All	27/2/2009	1	70	V	Final
3	PAEM Material	2	15/3/2009	1	45	V	Final
4	Format and procedures for quarterly reporting. Draft report to CPMU	All	10/04/2009	1	26	E	Final
5	Indigenous Knowledge and Manual for Surveying Indigenous Knowledge	2	20/04/2009	1	20	V	Final



No	Document Title	Component	Date submitted to CPMU/ADB	Quantity of reports	Total Pages	Language E: English V: Vietnamese	Current Status
6	M&E Logframe for AST Project	All	24/4/2009	1	18	E, V	Draft
7	Management and Evaluation Regulations for Research Projects	1	20/5/2009	1	26	E, V	Final
8	FFS Methodology for Some Plants	2	5/2/2009	1	45	V	Final (training material)
9	PRA Manual	1	10/6/2009	1	23	V	Final (training material)
10	Project Management and focal issues for research project leaders and institute managers	1	13/6/2009	1	13	E, V	Final (training material)
11	M&E Framework and indicators for projects funded under client-oriented agriculture research program of AST Project. Guidelines, procedures and reporting formats	1	16/6/2009	1	33	E, V	Final – used as basis for training of research project leaders by CPMU and Consultants in June and October 2009
12	M&E framework for research projects	1	6/7/2009	1	14	E, V	No feedback from ADB yet
13	M&E framework for agricultural extension projects	1	6/7/2009	1	15	E, V	No feedback from ADB yet
14	Monitoring and Evaluation of	All	12/7/2009	1	33	E, V	Final

No	Document Title	Component	Date submitted to CPMU/ADB	Quantity of reports	Total Pages	Language E: English V: Vietnamese	Current Status
	Training. Guidelines and procedures for monitoring and evaluation of AST Project training programs and courses						
15	M&E Manual for Agricultural Extension Activities	2	7/2009	1	26	V	Final (training material)
16	Planting Techniques (maize, rice, soya...)	2	7/2009	1	26	V	Final (training material)
17	M&E Logframe for AST Project	All	11/9/2009	1	15	E, V	Final; no objection from ADB
18	Reporting Format for Institutes, Schools & Provinces	All	10/9/2009	3	9	E, V	Final
19	Report on meeting with Director and staff of Plant Protection Research Institute re organic and safe vegetable production	1	5/11/2009	1	5	E	Final (to CPMU Project Director and ADB Project Officer as requested)
20	Research Priorities Framework	1	6/11/2009 & 30/11/2009	2	15 20	E, V	Final (training material) Final (training material)
21	Preparations for AST Project Mid-Term Review: Action Plan	All	4/12/2009	1	7	E	Draft – CPMU

No	Document Title	Component	Date submitted to CPMU/ADB	Quantity of reports	Total Pages	Language E: English V: Vietnamese	Current Status
			23/12/2009			V	submitted to ADB draft
22	3 <sup>rd</sup> Quarter report (7-9/2010)	All	15/10/2010	1	20	E, V	Final
23	4 <sup>th</sup> Quarter report (10-12/2010)	All	15/1/2011	1	20	E, V	Draft

## (\$ million)

As of 30 November 2010

[illegible]





Appendix 11

Loan 2283-VIE: Agriculture Science and Technology Project  
Status of Loan Utilization (US\$)

as of 30 November 2010

Cat. No.	Category	Allocation		Contracts	Disbursements	Uncommitted Loan Balance	Undisbursed Loan Balance
		SDR	USD Equiv				
1	Civil Works	809,000	1,228,610	1,226,000	922,000	2,610	306,610
2	Equipment	5,123,000	8,489,511	7,560,000	5,865,000	929,511	2,624,511
3	Vehicles	24,000	36,453	21,000	21,000	15,453	15,453
4	Materials	1,429,000	2,645,586	0	0	2,645,586	2,645,586
5	Training	4,276,000	6,313,720	4,100,000	3,983,000	2,213,720	2,330,720
6	Research/Extension Contracts	5,315,000	8,169,558	6,720,000	5,895,000	1,449,558	2,274,558
7	Consulting Services	661,000	1,352,150	1,062,397	720,000	289,753	632,150
8	Incremental Operating Costs	446,000	740,241	391,000	375,000	349,241	365,241
9	Interest Charge	415,000	625,791	51853	51,853	573,938	573,938
10	Unallocated	1,700,000	900,255	0	0	900,255	900,255
99	Imprest Account	0	0	3,000,000	3,000,000	-3,000,000	-3,000,000
	<b>Total</b>	<b>20,198,000</b>	<b>30,501,875</b>	<b>24,132,250</b>	<b>20,832,853</b>	<b>6,369,625</b>	<b>9,669,022</b>

**COMPLIANCE WITH LOAN COVENANTS**  
(As of December 2010)

Reference in LA	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
Sec 4.02 (a)	The Borrower shall (i) maintain, or cause to be maintained, separate accounts for the Project; (ii) have such accounts and related financial statements audited annually, in accordance with appropriate auditing standards consistently applied, by independent auditors whose qualifications, experience and terms of reference are acceptable to the Asian Development Bank (ADB); (iii) furnish to ADB, as soon as available but in any event not later than 6 months after the end of each related fiscal year, certified copies of such audited accounts and financial statements and the report of the auditors relating thereto (including the auditors' opinion on the use of the Loan proceeds and compliance with the financial covenants of this Loan Agreement as well as on the use of the procedures for imprest account/statement of expenditures), all in the English language; and (iv) furnish to ADB such other information concerning such accounts and financial statements and the audit thereof as ADB shall from time to time reasonably request.	Central Project Management Unit (CPMU), Provincial Project Management Units (PPMU), and Institute Project Management Units (IPMU)	Being complied with  (i) Separate accounts are being maintained for project including level 1 account at CPMU, and level 2 at 5 PPMUs, 10 institutes, 10 schools (ii) Project accounts were audited and prepared annual financial statement. (iii) Annual financial statement were submitted to ADB in time at the request
Sec 4.02 (b)	The Borrower shall enable ADB, upon ADB's request, to discuss the Borrower's financial statements for the Project and its financial affairs related to the Project from time to time with the auditors appointed by the Borrower pursuant to Section 4.02(a), and shall authorize and require any representative of such auditors to participate in any such discussions requested by ADB, provided that any such discussion shall be conducted only in the presence of an authorized officer of the Borrower unless the Borrower shall otherwise agree.	CPMU, PPMUs, and IPMUs	Being complied with
Sec 4.03	The Borrower shall enable ADB's representatives to inspect the Project, the goods financed out of the proceeds of the Loan, and any relevant records and documents.	CPMU, PPMUs, and IPMUs	Being complied with
Sched. 4, para. 7 (a)	The Borrower shall ensure that all Goods and Works procured (including without limitation all computer hardware, software and systems, whether separately procured or incorporated within other goods and services procured) do not violate or infringe any industrial property or intellectual property right or claim of any third party.	CPMU, PPMUs, and IPMUs	Being complied with As of Apr 2010 do not have any feedback on this matter
Sched. 4, para. 7 (b)	The Borrower shall ensure that all contracts for the procurement of Goods and Works contain appropriate representations, warranties and, if appropriate, indemnities from the contractor or supplier with respect to the matters referred to	CPMU, PPMUs, and IPMUs	Being complied with

Reference in LA	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
	in subparagraph 7 (a) of Schedule 4.		
Sched. 4, para. 8	The Borrower shall ensure that all ADB-financed contracts with consultants contain appropriate representations, warranties and, if appropriate, indemnities from the consultants to ensure that the consulting services provided do not violate or infringe any industrial property or intellectual property right or claim of any third party.	CPMU	Being complied with There have not any complaint on this.
Sched. 5, para. 3	The Central Project Management Unit (CPMU), headed by a Project Director, shall be established in the Agricultural Project Management Board under MARD, and comprise a Deputy Director, a planning officer, a finance and accounting officer, a monitoring and evaluation officer, and other necessary supporting staff on a full-time basis. The CPMU shall be responsible for day-to-day Project implementation; interdepartmental coordination among MARD's concerned departments; central-level procurement, consultant recruitment, and fund disbursement; and provision of support to the Provincial Project Management Units (PPMUs).	MARD, APMB, CPMU	Complied The CPMU within MARD's Agricultural Projects Management Board was established on 9 March 2006 based on decision No. 651/QĐ/BNN-TCCB of MARD. The CPMU accordance with Ministries, Departments under MARD implemented in compliance with goal, target, activities of each component of project and closely monitored project implementation progress.
SCHED. 5, PARA. 4	The PPMU, headed by a PPMU manager, shall be established under the provincial department of agriculture and rural development in each of the Project provinces, and comprise a planning officer, a monitoring and evaluation officer, an accountant, and other necessary supporting staff. The PPMU shall be responsible for (i) overall management and supervision of Project activities related to agricultural extension in the concerned province, including contractual arrangements for service delivery, finance and project accounting, procurement, monitoring and evaluation, and reporting, and (ii) provincial-level coordination among the relevant provincial departments. Each of the PPMUs shall have a meeting with the CPMU at least once every other month. Project implementation units may be established under participating research institutes, and technical and vocational training schools, if required and deemed appropriate, to facilitate the Borrower's decentralization policy for project implementation and management.	MARD, Provincial People's Committees (PPC), DARD, PPMU, CPMU	Complied <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5 PPMUs were established in Apr-May 2007. Each PPMU comprises a director, an accountant, and a coordinator.</li> <li>IPMUs w. established comprising 10 research institutes and 10 agricultural colleges and vocational schools. Each IPMU comprises a director, an accountant, a monitoring and evaluation staff, a technical staff and a project staff. MARD issued Decision 455/QĐ-BNN-DANN, dated 01 Feb 2008 on decentralization and assignments of AST's implementation.</li> </ul>
Sched. 5, para. 2	The Project Steering Committee (PSC), headed by a Vice Minister of MARD, shall be	MARD, MPI, MOF, SBV,	Complied The PSC was established



Reference in LA	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
	established and comprise representatives of concerned departments of MARD, the Ministry of Planning and Investment, the Ministry of Finance, the State Bank of Vietnam, the Ministry of Science and Technology, the Ministry of Education and Training, and the Project provinces. The PSC shall be responsible for interministerial coordination and provision of overall policy guidance to the Project and shall endorse the Project annual work plans and budget. Representatives of farmers' associations and other Project's stakeholders shall participate in the PSC meetings as required.	MOST, and PPMU	on 4 June 2007. PSC organized the quarterly meetings with representatives from Ministries, Departments and representatives of stakeholders. The most recent meeting was organized on 20 October 2010 on evaluation of project implementation progress and agreement on solution to problems and constraints.
Sched. 5, para. 5	The Borrower shall ensure that adequate counterpart staff and funds will be provided for operation and maintenance of the Project facilities upgraded in the selected agriculture research institutes, and further ensure that such institutes will provide adequate staff and funds for operation and maintenance after their transformation into self-financed organizations in accordance with the Borrower's Decree No. 115, issued in 2005.	SBV, IPMU	Being complied with Institutes have ensured that they provide enough staff with capacity and MARD ensured that they will provide counterpart funds for equipment procurement of 10 project schools.
Sched. 5, para. 6	MARD shall establish a committee, represented by the Science and Technology Council of MARD, other relevant government agencies, universities, private sector organizations and agro-industries, to examine and select research proposals to be funded under the Project on a competitive basis.	MARD	Complied MARD issued decision No. 1322/QĐ-BNN-KHCN to establish a science and technology committee with 11 members from DSTE under MARD, Ministry of Planning and Investment, VAAS, Viet Nam Gardening Associations (VGA), Vietnam National Vegetable, Fruit and Agricultural Product Corporation, Agricultural Project Management Board on 02 May 2008
Sched. 5, para. 7	The Borrower shall ensure that the following criteria will be applied for selecting such research proposals: (i) appropriateness to the client needs in the region through the results of participatory rural assessments; (ii) relevance to the national sector goals, strategies, and priorities; (iii) technical and financial viability and sustainability; (iv) linkage with agricultural extension and effective mechanisms for participatory technology development and information dissemination; (v) compliance with social and environmental	MARD	Complied Procedures on process and selection criteria of research projects including need-based selection criteria were approved by Deputy Minister of MARD on 20 June 2008 based on decision No.1874/QĐ-BNN-KHCN and approved by ADB on 7 July 2008. 125 of 550 research proposals which come from research institutes

Reference in LA	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
	<p>requirements;</p> <p>(vi) involving at least one provincial agricultural extension center or extension advisory council; and</p> <p>(vii) not more than \$100,000 for each research proposal.</p>		<p>and organizations in country were selected. All research proposals were selected in compliance with ADB regulations, customer's need was identified based on agricultural extension staff system at the levels in provinces participating in research proposal implementation. Not more than \$100,000 for each research proposal. Research proposals taken into consideration climate change, sanitary or phyto-sanitary standards, poverty status of clients and market linkage.</p>
Sched. 5, para. 8	The Borrower shall ensure that overseas study programs to be funded under the Project will be carried out in a manner acceptable to ADB. In particular, the Borrower shall ensure that appropriate arrangements are developed so that the trainees participating in the overseas study programs will provide relevant services after returning from the programs. Such arrangements shall be developed in consultation with ADB prior to the implementation of the study programs. The selection of the trainees shall be subject to ADB's approval.	DOP, CPMU	<p>Being complied with Positive support to trainees studying overseas. Trainees after completion of overseas training courses will return to MARD</p>
Sched. 5, para. 9	The Borrower shall ensure that at least 10% of the trainees are women.	DOP, CPMU	<p>Complied As of 30 November 2011, 24% of trainees are women studying overseas</p>
Sched. 5, para. 10	The Borrower shall ensure that demonstration trials and extension services under the Project will be implemented in poor communes where at least 30% of households are classified as poor households, as defined by the Borrower's appropriate laws and regulations.	CPMU, and PPMU, PAEC	<p>Being complied with All communes participating in AST have at least 30% households that are poor</p>
Sched. 5, para. 11	<p>The Borrower shall ensure that the following criteria will be applied for the extension contracts financed under Component 2.2 as described in paragraph 2 of Schedule 1 to the Loan Agreement:</p> <p>(i) Extension contracts are in line with the provincial plan for agricultural extension in the respective province;</p> <p>(ii) they focus on the priority subjects included in the plan for improved knowledge and technology related to crop and livestock production and marketing; and</p>	CPMU, and DARD, PPMUs	<p>Being complied with 100% of all EA contracts is lower than \$10,000</p>

Reference in LA	Covenant	Responsibility	Status of Compliance
	(iii) Each of the extension contracts shall cost up to the maximum of \$10,000.		
Sched. 5, para. 12	The Borrower shall ensure that Project activities will be implemented in line with the Project's gender action plan, as agreed between the Borrower and ADB. In particular, the agreed gender action plan shall be reflected in the provincial plans for agricultural extension to be developed under the Project.	CPMU, PPMU, and IPMU	Being complied with Provincial Action Plans of 5 PPMUs were approved reflecting gender issues as per the Gender Action Plan.
Sched. 5, para. 13	The extension contracts to be funded under the Project shall have provisions that at least 40% of beneficiaries of these services are women. The contracts to be awarded in the final year of project implementation shall have provisions that at least 50% of beneficiaries are women.	CPMU, PPMU, and IPMU	Being complied with There were 47.1% of households where head of household are women participating in AE contract implementation. Women beneficiaries are 48.75%
Sched. 5, para. 14	The Borrower shall ensure that Project activities will be implemented in line with the Project's specific actions for indigenous peoples, as agreed between the Borrower and ADB, and that the agreed specific actions for indigenous peoples will be reflected in the provincial plans for agricultural extension to be developed under the Project.	CPMU, and PPMUs	Being complied with There were specific activities for indigenous people and ethnic people in Province in Provincial Action Plan of 5 PPMUs
Sched. 5, para. 16	The Borrower shall ensure that civil works to be financed under the Project will not require resettlement or land acquisition, as defined in ADB's Policy on Involuntary Resettlement. If, due to unforeseen circumstances, such resettlement or land acquisition is unavoidable, the Borrower shall (i) prepare a resettlement plan in accordance with ADB's Policy on Involuntary Resettlement; (ii) submit it to ADB for approval prior to awarding the concerned civil works contract; and (iii) ensure that any resettlement activities will be carried out in compliance with the resettlement plan.	CPMU, 10 technical and vocational training schools	Being complied with Civil works were carried out within the existing compounds of 10 technical and vocational training schools and did not require land acquisition.
Sched. 5, para. 17	The Borrower shall ensure that (i) environmental impact assessments under Category II, as defined under the Borrower's laws and regulations, will be carried out during the design phase of all civil works, and (ii) the environmental monitoring plan for the Project will be effectively implemented.	CPMU, 10 technical and vocational training schools	Being complied with In accordance with Vietnamese law, an environmental impact assessment report was prepared before any civil works were built.



Appendix 13: PROPOSED REALLOCATION

Category	Category name	Allocation SDR	Allocation USD (\$)	Contracts awarded US(\$)	Balance for procurement USD (\$)	Disbursed USD (\$)	Projected Expenditures until end of project USD (\$)	Total requirements until end of Project USD (\$)	Proposed Reallocation
		a	b	c	d=b-c	e	f	g=c+f	
01	Xây lắp	809,000	1,228,610	921,357	307,253	411,267	307,253	1,228,610	
02	Thiết bị	5,123,000	7,739,511	2,893,538	4,845,973	1,499,616	5,595,973	8,489,511	750,000
03	Phương tiện đi lại	24,000	36,453	20,081	16,372	20,081	16,372	36,453	
04	Vật liệu	1,429,000	2,145,586	0	2,145,586	0	2,645,586	2,645,586	500,000
05	Tập huấn	4,276,000	6,413,720	1,280,595	5,133,125	1,280,595	5,033,125	6,313,720	(100,000)
06	Hợp đồng nghiên cứu/khuyến nông	5,315,000	7,969,558	2,007,287	5,962,271	2,007,287	6,162,271	8,169,558	200,000
07	Dịch vụ tư vấn	661,000	1,002,150	1,090,971	(88,821)	437,691	261,179	1,352,150	350,000
08	Chi phí hoạt động dự án gia tăng	446,000	672,645	256,912	415,733	256,912	483,329	740,241	67,596
09	Thay đổi lãi xuất	415,000	625,791	0	625,791	51,853	625,791	625,791	
10	Chưa phân bổ	1,700,000	2,552,482	0	2,552,482	0	900,255	900,255	
11	Tài khoản tạm ứng	0	115,369	0	115,369	3,000,000	0	0	
	Tổng	20,198,000	30,501,875	8,470,741	22,031,134	8,965,302	22,031,134	30,501,875	
				0.28		0.29			

Note: Contract awards and disbursement figures taken from ADB LFIS  
SDR and US\$ allocation figures taken from ADB LFIS



**M&E SYSTEM – AST project- from July 2007 to 15 Apr 2010**  
**Loan 2283-VIE(SF)**

**A. Impact**

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
<b>Impact</b> <b>Sustainable and equitable agricultural growth achieved</b>	<p>Five years after the Project completion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aggregate value added and exports of the agriculture sector to increase at about 3.0 to 3.2% and 12.3 -14.3% respectively per year from 2006-2010 in line with the 5-Year</li> <li>• Socio-economic Development Plan Poverty incidence in rural areas decreased from 45% (2003)</li> </ul>	Not yet evaluated		
<b>Data Sources and Reporting Mechanisms:</b> (i) National Accounts; (ii) National agricultural statistics (annual yields, production volume and value, varieties of crops and other products, and other relevant data); (iii) Poverty assessments; (iv) Monitoring by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) and Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI)				

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
<b>Assumptions and Risks</b> <b>Assumptions:</b> (i) Macroeconomic stability maintained during the project period; (ii) The country's agriculture sector continues to be effectively integrated into international markets; (iii) Sustainable use of on-farm and off-farm natural resources				
<b>B. Outcome</b>				
National system of agriculture science and technology (AST) strengthened				
	1. 5%-10% increase in farm household income associated with new varieties, technologies, processes or practices	Not yet evaluated		
	2. Number of poor farmers supported and advised from project extension services			
	3. Average of about 80% of graduates from ten Project schools enter into full-time employment			
	4. % reduction in environmental degradation associated with adoption of new (environmentally friendly) technology, process or practice			
Data Sources and Reporting				

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
<b>Mechanisms:</b> (i) Monitoring by MARD and CPMU; (ii) Project review missions ADB; (iii) Project monitoring system and evaluation report; (iv) Regular dialogue with key stakeholders involved in the national AST system, including extension centers and research institutes  <b>Assumptions and Risks</b> <b>Assumptions:</b> (i) Continued Government commitment to the market-oriented agriculture sector in line with the national socioeconomic development plans; (ii) Continued Government policies and actions to streamline AST institutions to respond to the national development goals; and (iii) Agriculture market information systems effectively implemented				
<b>Output</b> <b>Output 1</b>  Client-oriented Research and Capacity Strengthening				
<b>Sub-component 1.1</b> <b>Client-oriented Research program</b>				
	1. 125 research programs are properly implemented	Conducted 125 research project	Almost research projects were implemented in accordance with	

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
			plan and achieved good result	
	2. 40% of the research investments are in mountainous and remote areas	74.5% of the research investments are in mountainous and remote areas	Almost research projects were implemented in mountainous and remote area so it is very difficult to travel	
	3. More than 60% of research projects that address poverty reduction and food security	65% of research projects that address poverty reduction and food security %		
	4. Number of varieties, technologies and processes developed, applied or adapted for use by farmers or other users	Have not had outputs yet		
	5. At least 50% of research project results are adopted by extension services for on-farm trials	Have not had outputs yet		
	6. At least 250 researchers involved in 125 client-oriented research projects receive training on ADB social and environmental safeguards	125 project leaders received documents on ADB social and environmental safeguards		Dissemination of this policy to all members of research group
	7. 50% of research projects produce short-term results at a relatively low cost that can easily be extended to poor	Have not had outputs yet		Need to extend research duration to researchers have enough time to set up demonstration

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	farmers			model and transfer research result to farmers
	8. 3 000 farmer households participating in research project activities including 30% women head households and 20% of ethnic minorities	850 farmer households participating in research project activities including 35% women head households and 18% of ethnic minorities	Because this is the first year of implementation, almost research project is conducting research experiment so farmer participation is limited	
	9. 1200 farmers and extension staff or other users that have been trained under research projects about the technology or process including 30% of women and 40% of ethnic minorities	2000 farmers participating in training courses including 44.8% of women, 53.7% of ethnic minorities	Due to research projects have implemented for one year, training activities are still limited	
	10. 30% of research projects that have strengthened linkages with private sector and have established a link with companies for marketing	23.2% of research projects that had linkages or oriented to link with private sector		
	11. 100 % of research projects increase from 10-20% of profitability in comparison with reality	Have not had result yet		
	12. 25% of research projects that address climate change	31 research projects that address climate change adaptation and mitigation		



Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	adaptation and mitigation and environmental improvement	and environmental improvement, reaching to 24%		
	13. 30 % of women are project leaders	36 women are science research project leaders reaching 29%		
<b>Sub-component 1.2</b> <b>Training of research staff</b>				
	1. 50 training courses for research Institutes attended by 1200 participants including 30% of women	29 training courses for research staff from Institutes with 667 participants including 43% of women	Training courses were well organized and high quality	
	2. 100% of training courses are evaluated input and output questionnaires and result report	Average ratio: 84.6% of trainees assessed that the training courses matched their demand, and 88% of trainees evaluate quality of training courses are quite good		
	3. 50% of training courses for researchers held during the second half of the Project incorporate climate change mitigation and adaptation	In processing of identifying demand and preparing		Financing more fund for VAAS to organize additional training courses of research staff of Institutes
	4. A study tour to Korea organized for representatives of Institutes, DSTe and CPMU	Organized a study tour to Korea for 20 participants including 30% of women		
	5. 18 PhDs, 32 Masters Degrees and 5 Post-docs awarded	18 PhDs, 20 Masters Degrees and 5 Post-docs awarded completed their training program	Low progress, 6 candidates will complete their study program at the end of Apr 2013 and 10 candidates	Candidates will have more time to finish their training program if project is extended

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
			on No 2013	
	6. At least 10 % of overseas candidates are women	Achieved 19,5% of women		
	7. 30% of overseas study programs that include environmental subjects	29.3% of candidates that their overseas training program includes environmental subjects		
	8. 100% of candidates study oversea awarded certification or degree	2 candidates study Pos-doc were awarded		
	9. 100% of candidates return back their organization after completion of training program	2 candidates finished their training program and returned back their organizations	The candidates after completion of their training program effectively adapted their learned knowledge to their job	
<b><u>Sub-component 1.3: Upgrade research and laboratory equipment</u></b>	1. 100% of equipment procured by Project installed and utilized by 4 <sup>th</sup> quarter 2010	There have been 26/31 bidding package in bided, 17 packages awarded and 7 packages procured equipments		
	2. At least 75% of capacity of equipments installed and utilized effectively	Not yet evaluated		
	3. At least 80% of laboratories have installed preliminary environmental treatment facilities	Not yet evaluated		
	4. 100% of equipment and machines meet government of Viet Nam environmental standards	Not yet evaluated		
<b>Data Sources and Reporting</b>		Data sources from: (i)		

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
<b>Mechanisms:</b> (i) Monitoring by MARD and MPI and ADB review missions; (ii) Project monitoring system and progress reports, including inventories of equipment and staff lists; (iii) Midterm and completion reviews of the Project; (iv) Regular dialogue with key stakeholders involved in the national AST system  <b>Assumptions and Risks</b> <b>Assumptions:</b> (i) The Government's plan for research institute reorganization implemented; (ii) Skilled staff retained in the national AST system; (iii) Adequate financial resources for proper operation and maintenance  <b>Risk:</b> Inappropriate intervention into procurement and selection of trainees		annual, quarterly progress reports of research institutes and project leaders (ii) Monitoring report of Agencies, Units under MARD and CPMU. (iii) ADB Review Mission Report, ADB Mid-Term Review Report (iv) annual finalization meeting  Typhoon, storm and drought in central region effected to research project implementation. There were 3 research projects in damage, need to re-set up experiments.		
<b>Output 2</b>  <b>Component 2</b> <b>Grassroots Agriculture Extension Improvement</b>				
<b>Subcomponent 2.1</b> <b>Pro-poor Provincial Agricultural Extension Services</b>	1. Number of workshops held in 2008 and 2009 to identify extension priorities	92 workshops identified extension needs have been deployed with 3361 participants		

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	2. Five provincial extension plans approved by MARD on March 2009	Five provincial extension plans approved by PPC and submitted to CPMU and ADB in 2009		
	3. Results from the survey of indigenous technical knowledge in 50 Districts	4/5 provinces completed the survey of indigenous technical knowledge and report		
	4. TOT group has been established with number of 43 people (8 people in each province)	Conducted 5 groups of TOT with number of 43 people (8 -10 people in each province)		Organize improvement training for TOT group
	5. Organized 270 training programs at 5 provinces, 79 districts, and 1405 communes	Organized 302 courses for all districts of 5 provinces		
	6. Training for 100 provincial agricultural extension staff, 400 district extension staff and 5,500 service providers.	205 provincial extension staff, 802 districts staff and 1224 service providers participated the training		
	7. 100% training courses are evaluated inputs, outputs and reports	100% training of organized evaluation	Evaluation results of training has not been made	
	8. 5 training document files of 5 provinces have been completed with good quality and appropriate content	2 draft training documents have been completed in Thanh Hoa and Nghe An		
	9. 30% of the training material produced under the project is for poor farmers with limited literacy, with illustrations and	Not yet evaluated		

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	pictures			
	10. 50% of remaining training courses incorporate market linkages for the poor	The province is planning training for next year		
	11. 70% of remaining training courses incorporate training on: gender mainstreaming, participatory method, and climate change, environmental, social, and health implications of agricultural technologies	The province is planning training for next year		
	12. Organize agricultural extension study tour to Thai Lan for staff of 5 PPMUs, MARD and CPMU to Thailand conducted	Conducted study tour in Thailand with 24 people in which women representing 25%		
	13. 12 domestic study tours for PPMUs, provincial, district extension staff and service providers	6 domestic study tours for PPMU, provincial extension staff in 4 provinces (not yet in Quang nam)		
	14. 50 study tours for local extension members and key farmers, including 10 trips to study business in safe vegetable / organic agriculture as Metro Supermarket or other enterprises in nationwide	Not yet evaluated		
	15. Number of extension information packages broadcasted on radio and television	Not yet evaluated		
	16. 60% of information packages on safe agricultural food production method for poor	Not yet evaluated		



Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	farmers			
	17. At least 20% of the volume focuses on information technology and processes to reduce or adapt to climate change.	Not yet evaluated		
	18. At least 70% of poor and ethnic households in 157 project communes accessed to information broadcasted by project communication channel	Not yet evaluated		
	19. Conduct a mobil phone trial to evaluate possibility of using mobile phone in information dissemination for poor farmers	Not yet of evaluated		
<b>Sub-Component 2.2 Promotion of extension contracts</b>	1. 500 extension contracts will be awarded in 157 poor communes	272 extension contracts have been awarded for implementation in 157 project communes		
	2. At least 20% remaining extension contracts will be research trail model in the field	16 trials/ 272 models occupied 5,8%		
	3. 80% contract be awarded the remaining models of agricultural production, 5% marketing, 5% post-harvest technology; and 10% of production models in agriculture by biological measures and food safety	Making the plan for next years		
	4. At least 10,000 households participate in extension model	8396 households participated in agricultural extension models		
	5. At least 50% of participants in	8079 poor households		

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	the extension models are the rural poor households	participated in agricultural extension models occupied 96,2%		
	6. At least 50% participants of extension models will be women	47% of participants implementation of the model extension are women	The number of poor households to participate in implementing the extension model higher than planned	
	7. At least 20% beneficiaries of extension models will be ethnic minorities	16% beneficiaries of extension models are ethnic minorities		
	8. At least 20% beneficiaries of extension models will be came the key person in communes	Not yet of evaluation		
	9. At least 5% extension contracts in participatory of enterprises, private sectors to develop the technology or production of local to provide the market	Not yet of evaluation		
	10. 100% of remaining extension models will be oriented safeguards and environmental improvement	70 % extension models have been oriented safeguards and environmental improvement		
	11. 30% Farmers are invited to visit the demonstration models are women	Not yet of evaluation		
	12. 10% of extension contract evaluated economic efficiency, social and environmental impact	Not yet of evaluation for all models		
<b>Data Sources and Reporting Mechanisms:</b>		(i) Data source from progress reports of service providers, the		Will conduct an assessment of effective agricultural
(i) Monitoring by MARD and MPI				

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
(ii) ADB review missions; (iii) Project monitoring system and progress reports, including inventories of equipment and staff lists; (iv) Midterm and completion reviews of the Project; (v) Regular dialogue with key stakeholders involved in the national AST system		provincial PMUs, (ii) monitoring reports of NAFEC, CPMU (iii) statistics of the provincial ( Department of Statistics, the statistical office of the district (iv) the report periodic assessment and mid-term of the ADB mission (v) The reports meeting summarized in the end of year		extension model was accepted in June
<b>Assumptions and Risks</b> <b>Assumptions:</b> (i) Government procedures and regulations improved for the client-oriented AST system of the country (ii) Increased awareness among the stakeholder agencies about the need for client-oriented agricultural research activities				Will conduct an assessment in June
<b>Output 3</b>				
<b>Component 3</b> Rural -based Technical and Vocational training				
<b>Sub-component 3.1</b> Strengthening of management, teaching and curriculum	1. Conduct a study tour in China for representatives of 10 schools and DOP and CPMU	Already conducted a study tour in China for representatives of 10	Useful for people visiting them have applied learning	

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
improvement		schools and DOP and CPMU, including 15 people with 27% of women	experience in practical	
	2. 10 schools have strategic planning period 2010-2020	Strategic Plan developed by 10 schools were completed in 2009	According to progress	
	3. At least 20 priority sectors to improve the curriculum was developed for 10 schools	11 the curriculum was developed, in which have been deveping for 96 training materials.	3 the curriculum was developed and submitted but not approval	
	4. At least 10 % training materials integrated with marketing	Not available		
	5. At least 25% integrated curriculum to food hygiene and safety	Not yet had production, not yet assessed		
	6. At least 25 % curriculum, integration issues of climate change, and improve environmental conditions	Not yet had production, not yet assessed		
	7. 300 teacher / administrator trained in teaching methods, systems and process just compiled teaching skills	276 Teachers and administrators are trained		
	8. 100% of training courses evaluated inputs and ouputs and report prepration	Evaluation result: 80% of demand met and 91% presented that quality of training courses is good and fair		
	9. 20 seminars organized by the 10 schools with the participation of companies, organizations and professional associations to assess the job	Held 10 workshops in 10 schools completed the project before the assigned program compiled	Average 91% pa	

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	opportunities for students after graduation			
	10. 20% of students in 10 schools were trained by the link project (contract) between schools and private companies or factories, where companies use the labor	Not investigated		
	11. Number of books in school libraries by the purchase has information related to environmental issues	Not investigated		
	12. 100% schools of networked electronic library	100% of school libraries have been connected		
	13. At least 75% of students and staff of schools satisfied with the electronic library system	Not investigated		
	14. 100% schools of systems management software to students and to use good management	Ongoing		
<b><u>Sub-component 3.2</u></b> Invest in upgrading facilities, technology, equipment, books and teaching materials	1. 100% construction packages are completed and put into use in 2010 fourth quarter	9/10 packages are under construction and 3 packages have been completed		
	2. 100% of machinery, equipment and other construction projects meet the environmental standards of the Government of Vietnam	Not evaluated		
	3. At least 80% of the laboratory is equipped to treat the preliminary environmental aspects	Not evaluated		



Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
<b>Data Sources and Reporting Mechanisms:</b> (i) Monitoring by MARD and MPI (ii) ADB review missions; (iii) Project monitoring system and progress reports, including inventories of equipment and staff lists; (iv) Midterm and completion reviews of the Project; (v) Regular dialogue with key stakeholders involved in the national AST system		(i) Reports of School (ii) PMU, DOP Monitoring report (iii) the report periodic assessment and mid-term of the ADB mission (iv) the report meeting summarized in the end of year		
<b>Assumptions and Risks</b> 1. Economic degradation impact to labour employee 2. National curriculum guides developed in line with the national sector goals 3. Labor market information effectively communicated to technical and vocational schools				
<b>Output 4</b> <b>Project management</b>	1. CPMU established with 14 fulltime staff and 9 part-time staff 2. PPMUs established in five provinces with 27 full-time and 17 part-time staff 3. Establishment of IPMUs with 75 part-time staff 4. 80% of Project staff assessed as performing satisfactorily 5. Two independent consultants selected to support CPMU and	There are 23 staff working for CPMU including 14 full-time staff There are 39 staff working for 5 PPMUs including 22 full-time staff There are 75 part-time staff working for IPMUs Not yet evaluated 7 specialists were selected and working for	The consultants supported CPMU	

Planned Outcomes	Monitoring Indicators/ Targets	Progress	Assessment	Recommendation/ Actions
	5 extension specialist support 5 provinces	AST project from 2008 but Extension Specialist in Dak Nong stopped his engagement from Dec 2009	and PPMUs effectively	
	6. 29 person months of international consultants (7 specialists) and 96 person months of national consultants (8 specialists) supplied	Mobilized 15 person/months of international consultants (6 people), 54 person-months of national consultants(7 people), utilized 69 person-months, reaching 55%		
	7. All consultants are to implement in align with their terms of reference	All consultants are implementing in align with their terms of reference		
	8. There is at least one meeting/month organized between CPMU			
	9.	Meeting organized between the consultants and CPMU when need to discuss		
	10. 100% of AST Project activities have been monitored or evaluated	Organized monitoring and evaluation project activities		
	11. A least 10 training courses on procurement, bidding, M&E and accountability for staff of CPMU, five PPMUs and 20 IPMUs	Organized 8 training courses on accountability, bidding, monitoring and project management with 361 participants including 38,2% of women		

#### D. Activities with Milestones

Activities	Date	Progress	Assessment	Recommendations/ Actions
<b>1. Client-oriented agricultural research and capacity strengthening</b>				
<b>1.1 Provision of research funding</b>				
Organization and selection of 125 science research projects (Decision on 58 batch 1 client-oriented research projects, decision on 67 batch 2)	16/1/2009 and 14/6/2009	According to progress		
Organize training on research project management for 125 project leaders	June and 10/2009	According to progress		
Contracted and implemented 125 research projects	3-4 and 9-10/2009	According to progress		
M&E research projects implementation status	3/2009 – 12/2011	Was and in processing		
Mid-term reviews for batch 1 and batch 2	10/2010 and 6/2011			
Occasional reviews and approval of 125 research projects	9/2011 and 2/1012			
<b>1.2. Provision of training courses</b>				
Organize training in priority areas for staff of 10 research institutes	From 12/2008 to 2011	Was and in processing according to progress		
Select and send the candidates to abroad for oversea training program	2008 -2013	Was and in processing but slower than progress		
<b>1.3. Provision of research and laboratory equipment</b>				
	2008 – quarter 4/2010	Was and in processing according to progress		
<b>2. Grassroots agriculture extension improvement</b>				

- Identify priorities and develop provincial agricultural extension plans	2008 -2009	3 provinces according to progress		
- Establishment ToT team and organization of ToT teams training	2008 -2009			
- Survey local/indigenous survey	2009 -2010	4 provinces according to progress		
- Capacity building training of extension staff and local extension service providers	2008 -2011	5 provinces according to progress		
- Provide equipments and facilities for provincial agricultural extension center and district AE station	2009	Completed according to target		
- Organize overseas study tour and domestic study tours	2009 -2011	According to progress		
- Select suitably qualified and experienced service providers and conduct bidding for extension contract	2008 -2011	2 provinces quicker than progress, 3 provinces slower		
- Implement extension contracts	2008 -2011	2 provinces quicker than progress, 3 provinces slower		
- M&E extension contracts	2008-2012			
- Organize impact evaluation of completed extension contracts	2011 -2012			
Implement National Information and Communication Program (survey, training, procurement, selection of providers and implementation)	2009-2011	Later than progress		
<b>3. Rural-based Technical and Vocational Training</b>				
Organize workshops to develop strategic plans for 10 schools	2008 -2009	According to progress		
Organize workshops on training program and curriculum	2009	According to		



- Identify priorities and develop provincial agricultural extension plans	2008-2009	3 provinces according to progress		
- Establishment ToT team and organization of ToT teams training	2008-2009			
- Survey local/indigenous survey	2009-2010	4 provinces according to progress		
- Capacity building training of extension staff and local extension service providers	2008-2011	5 provinces according to progress		
- Provide equipments and facilities for provincial agricultural extension center and district AE station	2009	Completed according to target		
- Organize overseas study tour and domestic study tours	2009-2011	According to progress		
- Select suitably qualified and experienced service providers and conduct bidding for extension contract	2008-2011	2 provinces quicker than progress, 3 provinces slower		
- Implement extension contracts	2008-2011	2 provinces quicker than progress, 3 provinces slower		
- M&E extension contracts	2008-2012			
- Organize impact evaluation of completed extension contracts	2011-2012			
Implement National Information and Communication Program (survey, training, procurement, selection of providers and implementation)	2009-2011	Later than progress		
<b>3. Rural-based Technical and Vocational Training</b>				
Organize workshops to develop strategic plans for 10 schools	2008-2009	According to progress		
Organize workshops on training program and curriculum	2009	According to		

development and prepare action plan						
Organize training courses to improve capacity for teachers and staff of 10 schools	2009-2011	progress According to progress	to			
Organize overseas study tour	2009					
Organize curriculum development for 11 schools	2009 -2010	According to progress	to			
Assessment and approval of developed curriculum	2010 -2011					
Organize a workshop to identify curriculum needs and prepare plan to develop additional curricula	2010 -2012					
Organize English language training at each of the 10 schools	2009 -2010	According to progress	to			
Install and commission software of e-library network for 10 schools	2009 -2010					
Procure and install student management software	2010					
Prepare bidding plan and implement civil work packages for 10 schools	2009 - 2011					
Prepare equipment procurement and installation plans and bidding packages for 10 schools	2009 – quarter 4/ 2010					
Review and approve equipment and construction in 10 schools	2010 -2011					
Assess impact of activities	2011 -2012					
<b>Project Management</b>						
Establish the Central Project Management Unit, IPMUs and PPMU	2007					
Issue technical guidance and legal document for project implementation	2007-2008					
Establish Project Steering Committee	2008					
Select and engage and mobilize a team of consultants in accordance with ADB Guidelines on Use of Consultants	9/2008					
Capacity building training for management staff	2008-2011					
CPMU, PPMUs and IPMUs maintain project account records						

Quarterly progress reports prepared by CPMU on Project implementation for ADB and PSC	2007 – 12/2012			
Develop a M&E system to M&E project impact and performance effectively	2007 -2012			
Organize semi-annual and completion reviews of the Project	2010 and 2012			
<b>Inputs:</b> <b>ADB loan: SDR 20,198,000: (i)</b> Civil works: SDR 809,000; (ii) Equipments SDR 5,123,000, (iii) Vehicles SDR 24,000; (iv) Materials SDR 1,429,000, (v) Training SDR 4,276,000, (vi) Research/Extension contracts SDR5,315,000, (vii) Consulting services: SDR 661,000; (viii) Incremental operating costs SDR 446,000; (ix) Interest charge SDR 415,000 <b>(x) unallocated</b> SDR 1,700,000 <b>Government: \$10.0 million:</b> (i) Civil works: SDR xx; (ii) Equipments SDR xx, (iii) Vehicles xx ; (iv) Materials SDR xx , (v) Training SDR xx, (vi) Research/Extension contracts SDR xx , (vii) Consulting services: SDR xx ; (viii) Incremental operating costs SDR xx ; (ix) Interest charge SDR xx				